## Summary Contents

Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access ........................................ iii

NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law .......... iv

Contents ........................................................................................................ ix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Scope and Sources of Law</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Enforceable Security Interests</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Default As Precondition to Seizure</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Replevin</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Self-Help Repossession</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Unsecured Personal Property Taken During Repossession</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Using Bankruptcy to Prevent Repossessions</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Disposition of Repossessed Collateral Other Than by Creditor’s Sale: Reinstatement, Redemption, Strict Foreclosure, Sheriff’s Sale, and Consumer’s Sale</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Creditor’s Sale of the Collateral</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Determining the Deficiency or Surplus</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Defending a Deficiency Action</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Affirmative Consumer Remedies in Repossession Cases</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter/Appendix</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 14</td>
<td>Consumer Leases</td>
<td>527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 15</td>
<td>Liens</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Selected Uniform Commercial Code Provisions</td>
<td>599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Summary of State Repossession Laws</td>
<td>693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Federal Statutes and Regulations Relevant to Repossession</td>
<td>729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D</td>
<td>Sample Answers and Complaints</td>
<td>745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E</td>
<td>Sample Repossession Discovery and Request for Admissions</td>
<td>763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td>773</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Contents

Top Reasons to Use Your Digital Library Access ........................................ iii

NCLC Digital Library: The Leading Resource for All Consumer Law ........ iv

## Chapter 1

### Introduction ................................................................. 1

1.1 About This Treatise ...................................................... 1

1.1.1 All Subscribers Have Access to the Digital Edition ............... 1

1.1.2 Topics Covered in This Treatise .................................... 1

1.1.3 State Law Variations .................................................. 2

1.1.4 Organization of This Treatise ....................................... 2

1.1.5 Pleadings, Primary Sources, and Practice Tools .................. 3

1.1.6 Unreported Decisions and Clearinghouse Citations ............... 3

1.2 Other Resources .......................................................... 4

1.2.1 Researching UCC Law ................................................. 4

1.2.2 Researching State Consumer Credit Laws .......................... 4

1.2.3 Researching Bankruptcy Law ....................................... 5

1.3 Handling Repossession Cases .......................................... 5

1.3.1 Why Repossession Cases Are Important ........................... 5

1.3.2 Establishing a Repossession Practice ................................ 5

1.4 Analyzing a Repossession Case ........................................ 6

1.4.1 Introduction .............................................................. 6

1.4.2 Advising the Client Facing Repossession .......................... 6

1.4.3 What Law Applies? ..................................................... 6

1.4.4 Does the Creditor Have an Enforceable Security Interest? ... 6

1.4.5 Was the Consumer in Default? ..................................... 7

1.4.6 Was the Self-Help Repossession Conducted Properly? .......... 7

1.4.7 Did the Creditor Afford the Consumer the Right to Reinstate or Redeem and Notify the Consumer of the Repossession Sale? 7

1.4.8 Did the Creditor Dispose of the Collateral Properly? .......... 8

1.4.9 Has the Creditor Correctly Computed and Informed the Consumer of the Deficiency or Surplus? 8

1.4.10 Is the Creditor Barred from Recovering a Deficiency Judgment? 8

1.4.11 What Remedies Are Available? ..................................... 9

1.4.12 Special Issues in Manufactured Home Repossessions ......... 9

1.4.13 Repossession of Leased Property ................................ 10

1.5 Automobile Litigation Checklist ...................................... 10

1.5.1 Introduction .............................................................. 10

1.5.2 Legal Claims ............................................................ 10

1.5.3 Investigation and Litigation ......................................... 13

## Chapter 2

### Scope and Sources of Law .............................................. 17

2.1 Introduction .............................................................. 17

2.2 The Basics of UCC Article 9 .......................................... 17
## Repossessions

### 2.2.1 History of Article 9 and Its Amendments .................................................. 17
### 2.2.2 Substantive Overview of UCC Article 9 ...................................................... 18
### 2.2.3 Changes Made by 2001 Amendments to Article 9 ........................................ 19
#### 2.2.3.1 Summary of Substantive Changes .......................................................... 19
#### 2.2.3.2 Effective Date of Revised Article 9 ....................................................... 20
### 2.2.4 Scope of Article 9 ....................................................................................... 20
#### 2.2.4.1 Overview ............................................................................................... 20
#### 2.2.4.2 Article 9 Applies to Secured Transactions No Matter How Structured ........ 20
#### 2.2.4.3 Exclusions from Article 9 ........................................................................ 21
##### 2.2.4.3.1 True leases and bailments ................................................................. 21
##### 2.2.4.3.2 Deposit accounts ............................................................................. 22
##### 2.2.4.3.3 Tort claims, insurance claims, wage assignments, other exclusions .... 23
#### 2.2.4.4 Consensual Liens Versus Statutory Liens .................................................. 23
#### 2.2.4.5 Personalty Versus Realty ............................................................................. 23
##### 2.2.4.5.1 General ............................................................................................. 23
##### 2.2.4.5.2 Security interests in obligations secured by real estate ..................... 24
##### 2.2.4.5.3 When collateral includes both personalty and realty ......................... 24
#### 2.2.4.6 Security Interests Versus True Leases ...................................................... 25
#### 2.2.4.7 Consignments ....................................................................................... 25
#### 2.2.4.8 Article 9’s Coverage of Assignments ...................................................... 26
##### 2.2.4.8.1 General ............................................................................................. 26
##### 2.2.4.8.2 Article 9’s invalidation of restrictions on assignability; annuity contracts and tort settlements .......................................................... 26
### 2.2.5 Key Definitions Under Revised Article 9 ....................................................... 29
#### 2.2.5.1 Consumer Transactions and Consumer-Goods Transactions .................. 29
#### 2.2.5.2 Debtor, Obligor, and Secondary Obligor .................................................. 30
#### 2.2.5.3 Account, Account Debtor, Chattel Paper, General Intangible, Payment Intangible, and Instrument ............................................................. 30
### 2.3 Overview of Other Laws Affecting Repossessions ........................................... 32
#### 2.3.1 Other UCC Articles ................................................................................. 32
##### 2.3.1.1 UCC Article 2A .................................................................................... 32
##### 2.3.1.2 The Good Faith Requirement of Article 1 .............................................. 32
##### 2.3.1.3 Article 3’s Treatment of Cosigners ......................................................... 32
#### 2.3.2 State Consumer Credit Laws ................................................................. 33
##### 2.3.2.1 Types of Statutes .................................................................................. 33
##### 2.3.2.2 UCC Does Not Preempt State Consumer Credit Laws ...................... 34
##### 2.3.2.3 Scope of State Consumer Credit Laws .................................................. 34
#### 2.3.3 Other State and Federal Statutes Relevant to Repossession ...................... 35
##### 2.3.3.1 State Deceptive Practices (UDAP) Statutes .......................................... 35
##### 2.3.3.2 Federal Civil Rights Law ...................................................................... 35
##### 2.3.3.3 Truth in Lending and Consumer Leasing Acts ...................................... 36
##### 2.3.3.4 Servicemembers Civil Relief Act ............................................................ 37
##### 2.3.3.5 Fair Debt Collection Practices Act ......................................................... 37
##### 2.3.3.6 State Debt Collection Laws ................................................................. 37
##### 2.3.3.7 United States Bankruptcy Code ............................................................. 37
##### 2.3.3.8 State Lien Laws .................................................................................... 37

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
## Contents

2.3.9 Replevin Laws ........................................... 38  
2.3.10 State Foreclosure Law .................................. 38  
2.3.11 Rent-to-Own Statutes and State Leasing Statutes .......... 38

### 2.3.4 Common Law and Equitable Doctrines and Claims  
#### 2.3.4.1 Common Law Tort Claims  
#### 2.3.4.2 The Law of Bailments  
##### 2.3.4.2.1 Creation of a bailment  
##### 2.3.4.2.2 Duties of a bailee  
##### 2.3.4.2.3 Repossession by a bailor  
##### 2.3.4.2.4 Remedies in bailment cases  
##### 2.3.4.2.5 Distinguishing a bailment from a security interest

### 2.4 Choice of Law  
#### 2.4.1 Introduction  
#### 2.4.2 If the Contract Does Not Have a Choice of Law Clause  
#### 2.4.3 If the Contract Contains a Choice of Law Clause  
#### 2.4.4 Choice of Law Under Non-UCC Statutes

### 2.5 Preemption by Federal Law  
#### 2.5.1 Overview  
#### 2.5.2 No Preemption of Article 9  
#### 2.5.3 Other State Repossession Laws  
##### 2.5.3.1 Preemption Under OCC Rules  
##### 2.5.3.2 Application of Former OTS Preemption Regulation to State Repossession Laws

### 2.6 Preemption of State Laws Restricting the Types of Security Interests That Can Be Taken

#### Chapter 3 Enforceable Security Interests ........................................... 51  
#### 3.1 Valid Security Interest As Precondition to Seizure of Personal Property  
#### 3.2 Elements of a Valid Security Interest  
##### 3.2.1 General  
###### 3.2.1.1 Basic Requirements  
###### 3.2.1.2 Signed Agreement Unnecessary for Possessory Security Interests, Deposit Accounts, and Certain Commercial Collateral  
###### 3.2.1.2.1 Possession of the collateral pursuant to an agreement  
###### 3.2.1.2.2 Control of deposit accounts or certain types of business collateral

#### 3.2.2 Written Agreement Must Specifically Grant Security Interest  
##### 3.2.2.1 Agreement Must Be a Written or Electronic Document  
##### 3.2.2.2 Agreement Must Specifically Grant the Security Interest  
##### 3.2.2.3 Is Truth in Lending Disclosure an Adequate Grant?

#### 3.2.3 Debtor Must Sign or Otherwise Authenticate the Agreement  
##### 3.2.3.1 General  
##### 3.2.3.2 What Is a Valid Authentication?

#### 3.2.4 Unchecked Boxes, Blanks, and Amendments

#### 3.2.5 Creditor Must Give Value

#### 3.2.6 Debtor Must Have Rights in Collateral  
##### 3.2.6.1 The General Rule  
##### 3.2.6.2 Practical Implications
3.2.6.3 What “Rights in the Collateral” Are Sufficient; Exceptions to the General Rule ........................................ 60
3.2.7 Security Agreement Must Identify the Collateral ......................... 61
3.2.7.1 General Rule ........................................ 61
3.2.7.2 Relationship to Collateral’s Description in the Financing Statement ........................................ 63
3.2.7.3 When Identification of Collateral Is Accidentally Omitted ........ 64
3.2.7.4 Relationship to Truth in Lending Disclosure of Security Interest .... 65
3.2.8 Security Interest Must Not Be Otherwise Prohibited .................. 66
3.2.9 Perfection of Security Interest Is Not Necessary ......................... 66
3.3 Limits on Non-Purchase-Money Security Interests .......................... 67
3.3.1 Introduction ........................................ 67
3.3.2 Abuses ........................................ 67
3.3.3 Article 9’s Definition of Purchase-Money Security Interests; Irrelevance of Article 9 Rules to Consumer Issues Outside Bankruptcy ........................................ 67
3.3.3.1 General Article 9 Definition ........................................ 67
3.3.3.2 Article 9’s Definition When Debt Includes Non-Purchase-Money Collateral ........................................ 68
3.3.3.3 Effect of Refinancing or Payment on Purchase-Money Security Interest ........................................ 68
3.3.3.4 Who Has Burden of Proving Purchase-Money Nature of Security Interest? ........................................ 68
3.3.4 FTC Rule Prohibits Non-Purchase-Money Security Interests in Household Goods ........................................ 68
3.3.4.1 Introduction ........................................ 68
3.3.4.2 FTC Definition of Household Goods ........................................ 69
3.3.4.2.1 Items that are household goods ........................................ 69
3.3.4.2.2 Limited exceptions for electronic equipment, jewelry, antiques, and art ........................................ 70
3.3.4.3 Consumers and Creditors Covered by the Rule ...................... 70
3.3.4.4 Creditor Attempts to Evade the FTC Rule ............................ 72
3.3.4.5 Remedies for FTC Rule Violations ........................................ 72
3.3.5 State Restrictions on Non-Purchase-Money Security Interests ......... 73
3.3.6 Unfairness, Unconscionability, and Related Challenges .................. 77
3.3.7 Does Description Adequately Identify Non-Purchase-Money Collateral? ........................................ 77
3.3.7.1 Introduction ........................................ 77
3.3.7.2 Does Collateral Description Distinguish After-Acquired Property? ........................................ 78
3.3.7.3 Identification of Televisions, Radios, Musical Instruments, and Antiques ........................................ 78
3.3.7.4 Distinguishing Between Debtor’s Property and That Owned by Other Household Members ........................................ 78
3.4 Continued Enforceability After Security Interest Created .................. 79
3.4.1 Introduction ........................................ 79
3.4.2 Secured Party’s Interest in Proceeds of Collateral ......................... 79
3.4.3 When Debtor Transfers Collateral to Third Party ......................... 80
3.4.3.1 General ........................................ 80
3.4.3.2 Creditors with Unperfected Security Interests ..................... 81
3.4.3.3 Creditors Whose Interests Are Automatically Perfected ........ 81
3.4.3.4 Perfection by Filing Financing Statement or Indicating Lien on Certificate of Title ........................................ 81
3.8.4 Property Added to a Vehicle or Manufactured Home After a Security Agreement Is Signed (Accessions) ........................................... 98
3.8.5 Insurance Proceeds and Trade-Ins ............................................................. 99
3.8.6 Force-Placed Automobile Insurance As a Future Advance .................. 100
3.8.7 Automobile Title Loans ........................................................................ 100
  3.8.7.1 Nature of Automobile Title Loans ......................................................... 100
  3.8.7.2 Applicable Law .................................................................................. 101
  3.8.7.3 Has the Lender Created an Enforceable Article 9 Security Interest? .............................................................................. 102
  3.8.7.4 Pre-Repossession Notices and Redemption Rights .......................... 103
  3.8.7.5 Can an Automobile Title Lender Keep the Collateral in Satisfaction of the Debt? ............................................................... 104
  3.8.7.6 Notice and Manner of Conducting Repossession Sale .................. 104
  3.8.7.7 Surpluses and Deficiencies ................................................................ 104
  3.8.7.8 Automobile Title Loans in Bankruptcy .............................................. 105
3.9 Merchant Card Issuer’s Interest in Goods Purchased with Card .............. 106
  3.9.1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 106
  3.9.2 Is There a Valid Security Agreement? ...................................................... 106
     3.9.2.1 UCC Requirements ......................................................................... 106
     3.9.2.2 Can the Store Produce the Necessary Records? ................................. 107
  3.9.3 Is the Collateral Adequately Described? ...................................................... 108
  3.9.4 Determining Which Collateral Is Paid Off First ...................................... 108
  3.9.5 State Laws Prohibiting Credit Card Security Interests ........................... 109
  3.9.6 False Threats to Enforce Credit Card Security Interests ...................... 109
3.10 Consumer Remedies When Security Interest Is Invalid ........................ 109
  3.10.1 When Credit Property Insurance Based on Invalid Collateral ............ 109
  3.10.2 When Unnecessary Filing Fees or Non-Filing Insurance Charged ......... 109
  3.10.3 When Description of Collateral Is Overly Inclusive ............................... 110
  3.10.4 When Threats to Enforce an Invalid Security Interest Are Made ........ 110
  3.10.5 When Creditor Enforces Invalid Security Interests ............................... 110

Chapter 4

Default As Precondition to Seizure ................................................................. 113
4.1 Default and Acceleration ........................................................................... 113
  4.1.1 Default As Precondition to Repossession ................................................ 113
  4.1.2 Under the UCC the Definition of Default Is Determined by Agreement .... 113
  4.1.3 Relationship of Default and Acceleration ............................................. 114
  4.1.4 Agreement to Accelerate Required; Strict Construction of Grounds to Accelerate ................................................................. 115
  4.1.5 Validity Under the UCC of Contractual Grounds for Acceleration ......... 115
  4.1.6 Right to Notice of UCC of Contractual Grounds for Acceleration ......... 116
  4.1.7 Contract Provisions Waiving Debtor’s Right to Notice of Acceleration .... 117
      4.1.7.1 Waiver of Notice Usually Found Valid .............................................. 117
      4.1.7.2 Waiver Provisions Strictly Construed ............................................... 117
      4.1.7.3 When Notice Required Despite Waiver ............................................ 117
      4.1.7.4 Waiver Provisions May Be Unconscionable or Violate State Deceptive Practices Statutes .................................................. 117
  4.2 Limits on Default and Acceleration .......................................................... 118
    4.2.1 Limits on Nonpayment As Grounds for Default .................................... 118
    4.2.2 Limits on Acceleration at Will or When Creditor Insecure ................. 119
       4.2.2.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 119
       4.2.2.2 The UCC Limitation ................................................................... 119
4.6.1 Introduction ............................................. 140
4.6.2 Do Article 9 Rules Regulate Yo-Yo Transactions? ... 141
  4.6.2.1 Introduction ....................................... 141
  4.6.2.2 Article 9 Applies When No Written Contingency Clause Included. 141
  4.6.2.3 Article 9 Applies When Contingency Clause Is Not Binding .... 142
  4.6.2.4 Has the Contingency Occurred? ....................... 143
  4.6.2.5 Article 9 Applies to Condition Subsequent Agreements ....... 143
  4.6.2.6 Nominal Condition Precedent Sales Often Contain Characteristics of a Condition Subsequent Sale .......... 144
  4.6.2.7 Inconsistent Characteristics Indicate a Condition Subsequent Sale ........................................... 145
4.6.3 Yo-Yo Transaction’s Repossession Implications When Dealer Retains Only a Security Interest ....................... 146
  4.6.3.1 General ........................................... 146
  4.6.3.2 Default, Acceleration, and Repossession ............... 146
  4.6.3.3 Falsification of Credit Application As Cause for Default . 147
  4.6.3.4 Right to Cure or Reinstatement; No Breach of the Peace . 147
  4.6.3.5 Article 9 Notice and Disposition .................... 148
4.6.4 Implications When Article 9 Does Not Apply .............. 148

Chapter 5

Replevin ................................................................ 151
5.1 Scope of This Chapter ........................................ 151
5.2 Overview of Replevin ........................................ 151
  5.2.1 The Nature of the Replevin Action .................... 151
  5.2.2 Strict Compliance with Procedures for Prejudgment Writ of Replevin ........................................ 153
  5.2.3 Elements of the Replevin Action ...................... 153
  5.2.4 Overview of Replevin Procedures ...................... 156
  5.2.5 Relief Available in Replevin Action .................... 157
  5.2.6 Relationship Between Replevin and Conversion ....... 159
  5.2.7 Relationship Between Replevin and Article 9 ........ 159
  5.2.8 Debtor Strategies ...................................... 160
  5.2.9 Debtor Resistance to Sheriff’s Seizure of Collateral ... 161
5.3 Writ of Replevin: Prejudgment Seizure of Property ........ 161
  5.3.1 Constitutional Standards Controlling Writ of Replevin .... 161
    5.3.1.1 Practical Importance of Understanding Constitutional Standards ........................................ 161
    5.3.1.2 Due Process Challenges to the Ex Parte Issuance of Writs of Replevin .................................... 162
    5.3.1.3 Unreasonable Search and Seizure .................. 163
    5.3.1.4 State Constitutional Provisions .................... 164
  5.3.2 Procedural Requirements for Ex Parte Writs of Replevin 164
    5.3.2.1 Introduction ....................................... 164
    5.3.2.2 Does State Authorize Ex Parte Writs? ............ 164
    5.3.2.3 Challenging the Constitutionality of Writ of Replevin Procedures ........................................... 164
    5.3.2.4 Stated Grounds for Seeking Writ Ex Parte .......... 165
    5.3.2.5 The Affidavit and Complaint ...................... 166
    5.3.2.6 Judicial Supervision of the Writ ................... 167
    5.3.2.7 The Post-Seizure Hearing ......................... 168
    5.3.2.8 Debtor’s Consent to the Seizure ................... 168
    5.3.2.9 Debtor Remedies .................................. 168

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
5.3.2.9.1 Remedies based on unconstitutional process . . . . . . . 168
5.3.2.9.2 Remedies based on violation of state law . . . . . . . 169
5.3.3 Challenging Writ of Replevin at Hearing Prior to or Immediately
After Seizure ................................................................. 169
5.3.3.1 Introduction ............................................................ 169
5.3.3.2 Right to a Hearing .................................................... 169
5.3.3.3 The Court’s Jurisdiction to Issue Writ ................................ 170
5.3.3.4 Has a Complaint Been Filed? ........................................ 170
5.3.3.5 The Creditor’s Burden of Proof .................................... 171
5.3.3.6 Debtor’s Substantive Defenses and Counterclaims ............... 172
5.3.3.7 Attorney Fees ....................................................... 173
5.3.4 Creditor’s Bond and Debtor’s Counter-Bond ............................. 173
5.3.4.1 Challenging the Creditor’s Bond .................................. 173
5.3.4.2 Posting a Counter-Bond .............................................. 174
  5.3.4.2.1 General ............................................................ 174
  5.3.4.2.2 Waiver or reduction of the counter-bond amount . . . . . 175
5.4 The Trial on the Merits ...................................................... 175
5.4.1 Avoiding Trial by Reinstating the Contract ......................... 175
5.4.2 Consumer’s Substantive Defenses and Counterclaims .............. 175
  5.4.2.1 Raising Defenses .................................................... 175
  5.4.2.2 Can the Consumer Raise Counterclaims? ......................... 176
  5.4.2.3 Remedies for Wrongful Replevin ................................ 177
5.4.3 Creditor’s Failure to Pursue Replevin Action ......................... 178
5.5 Application of Replevin Statutes to Manufactured Home Seizures ... 179
  5.5.1 Introduction ............................................................ 179
  5.5.2 Determining If a Home Is Realty or Personality ..................... 180
  5.5.3 When Home Is a Fixture to Land or Treated As Realty ................ 181
    5.5.3.1 Article 9 Treatment of Homes That Are a Fixture to Land .......... 181
    5.5.3.2 Complications for Creditor Remedies When Home Is a Fixture .... 181
    5.5.3.3 When Creditor Has Security Interest in Home and the Land ....... 181
    5.5.3.4 When State Law Treats Home Not As a Fixture But As Realty .... 181
  5.5.4 Manufactured Home Conversion (Title-Purging) Statutes ............ 182
    5.5.4.1 General ............................................................ 182
    5.5.4.2 Implications of Conversion Statutes ................................ 182
    5.5.4.3 Protection of the Secured Party When Home Is Converted to Real Property .................................................. 183
    5.5.4.4 Conversion of Title Under Other Statutes ......................... 183
  5.5.5 Statutes Specifying How Manufactured Homes Are to Be Treated in Credit Transactions ................................. 184
  5.5.6 Other State Statutes .................................................... 184
  5.5.7 Whether Manufactured Home Is Treated As Realty in Absence of State Statute .................................................... 185
  5.5.8 The Manufactured Home Owner’s Ground Lease and the Secured Party ................................................................. 187

Chapter 6 Self-Help Repossession ............................................. 189
  6.1 Introduction ............................................................. 189
  6.2 Representing the Client Before Repossession ......................... 189
    6.2.1 Voluntary Surrender ............................................... 189
    6.2.2 Other Pre-Repossession Options ................................... 191
    6.2.3 False Threats to Repossess ......................................... 191
    6.2.4 Resisting Repossession Attempts .................................. 191
# Contents

6.6  Electronic Repossessions .......................... 225
  6.6.1  Nature of Electronic Car Repossession .......... 225
  6.6.2  Electronic Disablement and Repossession Law ........ 226
    6.6.2.1  Article 9 Does Not Authorize Disabling Vehicles ........................................ 226
    6.6.2.2  If Allowed, Any Disablement Must Comply with Article 9 ............................. 226
    6.6.2.3  FDCPA and State Law Applications When Creditor or Repossessor Disables Vehicle Without Intent to Take Possession ........................................ 227
  6.6.2.4  Limits on Self-Help Repossession Should Apply to Disablements ......................... 227
    6.6.2.4.1  Breach of the peace in electronic repossessions........................................ 227
    6.6.2.4.2  Federal, state, and tribal laws limiting self-repossession ........................... 228
    6.6.2.4.3  The bankruptcy stay .................................................................................. 228
  6.6.2.5  Electronic Disablement Allowed Only When Creditor Can Repossess ...................... 228
    6.6.2.5.1  Default requirement; expiration of cure or grace periods .......................... 228
    6.6.2.5.2  Consumer remedies ............................................................................. 229
  6.6.2.6  Consumer’s Removal of the Disabling Device ...................................................... 229
  6.6.2.7  Creditor’s Duties After Electronic Repossession .............................................. 229
  6.6.3  State Regulation of Electronic Disablement Devices ............................................. 230
  6.6.4  Other Challenges to Electronic Devices Installed in Vehicles .................................. 231
    6.6.4.1  Devices That Annoy May Violate Debt Collection Statutes .......................... 231
    6.6.4.2  Deception and Non-Disclosure .................................................................. 231
    6.6.4.3  Electronic Repossession As an Unfair Practice ............................................ 231
    6.6.4.4  Truth in Lending Act ............................................................................. 232
    6.6.4.5  Equal Credit Opportunity Act ..................................................................... 232
    6.6.4.6  State Credit Statutes .............................................................................. 232
    6.6.4.7  Credit Repair Laws .............................................................................. 232
    6.6.4.8  Privacy Concerns .................................................................................. 232
  6.6.5  Electronic Self-Help for Computer Software .......................................................... 233

## Chapter 7

Unsecured Personal Property Taken During Repossession .......................... 235
  7.1  Description of the Problem ........................................................................... 235
  7.2  Application of Bailment Law to Unsecured Personal Property ................. 235
  7.3  Steps for Consumer to Take Prior to Bringing Legal Action ....................... 235
    7.3.1  Demanding Return of the Property ................................................................ 235
    7.3.2  Documenting What Property Was Seized or Damaged and by Whom .......... 236
    7.3.3  Creditor Conditions As to Return of Unsecured Property ......................... 236
  7.4  Legal Claims Against Creditor for Seizing Unsecured Property ................. 237
    7.4.1  Common Law Tort Claims ........................................................................... 237
      7.4.1.1  Conversion Action If Unsecured Personalty Is Not Returned .................. 237
      7.4.1.2  Negligence Action If Personal Property Is Not Returned ....................... 239
      7.4.1.3  Trespass Action Even If Unsecured Personalty Is Returned ..................... 239
      7.4.1.4  Negligence Action If Unsecured Property Is Damaged ............................ 240
      7.4.1.5  Compensatory Damages ...................................................................... 240
      7.4.1.6  Creditor Liability for Acts of Repossessor .............................................. 240
      7.4.1.7  Punitive Damages Recoverable ............................................................... 240
    7.4.2  UCC Remedies .......................................................................................... 241
    7.4.3  FDCPA, Other Statutory Sources of Damages .............................................. 241
    7.4.4  Evidence and Proof Issues ........................................................................ 241
Chapter 8

Using Bankruptcy to Prevent Repossessions

8.1 Introduction

8.1.1 Relevance of Bankruptcy to Repossessions

8.1.2 Summary of This Chapter

8.2 The Automatic Stay

8.2.1 Purpose of the Automatic Stay

8.2.2 Stays Obtained by Filing for Bankruptcy

8.2.2.1 The Automatic Stay

8.2.2.2 The Codebtor Stay

8.2.3 Duration of the Automatic Stay

8.2.3.1 General Rule

8.2.3.2 Limitations Based on Repeat Filings

8.2.4 Scope of the Automatic Stay

8.2.4.1 Stay of Legal Proceedings

8.2.4.2 Stay of Acts Directed at Debtor’s Property (Including Repossession)

8.2.4.3 Other Acts Prohibited by the Stay

8.2.4.4 Exceptions to the Automatic Stay

8.2.5 Notice of the Automatic Stay

8.2.6 Enforcing the Stay

8.2.6.1 Remedies for Violations of the Stay

8.2.6.2 Violations of the Stay by Government Entities

8.2.6.3 Procedure

8.2.7 Proceedings Seeking Relief from Stay

8.2.7.1 Overview

8.2.7.2 Form of Proceeding

8.2.7.3 Time Limits for Court Actions

8.2.7.4 Grounds for Relief from Stay

8.2.7.5 Debtor and Trustee Must Be Named As Indispensable Parties

8.2.7.6 Debtor Must Conduct Speedy Discovery

8.2.7.7 Raising Defenses in Response to a Motion for Relief from Stay

8.2.7.8 Burden of Proof

8.2.7.9 Valuing Collateral to Determine Creditor’s Protection and Debtor’s Equity

8.2.7.10 Stays Pending Appeal

8.3 Turnover of Property

8.3.1 General Rule

8.3.2 Scope

8.3.3 Procedure

8.3.4 Issues of Possession After Turnover

8.4 Debtor’s Powers of Avoidance

8.4.1 Overview

8.4.2 Exempt Property

8.4.3 General Transfer and Lien Avoidance Principles
8.4.4 Power to Avoid Non-Possessory, Non-Purchase-Money Security Interests .......................................................... 261
8.4.5 Power to Avoid Judicial Liens ................................................................. 262
8.4.6 Debtor’s Right to Use Trustee’s Avoiding Powers ................................. 262
  8.4.6.1 Only Involuntary Transfers Covered ................................................. 262
  8.4.6.2 Strong-Arm Clause ....................................................................... 263
  8.4.6.3 Preferences .................................................................................... 263
  8.4.6.4 Fraudulent Conveyances ................................................................. 263
  8.4.6.5 Limitations on Debtor’s Use of Trustee’s Avoiding Powers ............ 264
8.4.7 Procedure for Use of Avoiding Powers ............................................. 265
8.5 Debtor’s Right to Redeem Secured Property in Chapter 7 Cases ... 265
  8.5.1 Purpose .............................................................................................. 265
  8.5.2 Limitations ........................................................................................ 265
  8.5.3 Payment of Redemption Amount ...................................................... 266
  8.5.4 Redemption in Practice ................................................................. 266
8.6 Chapter 13 Provisions Affecting Secured Claims ................................. 267
  8.6.1 Allowed Secured Claims ................................................................. 267
  8.6.2 Modification of Secured Creditor’s Rights ........................................ 267
    8.6.2.1 In General .................................................................................... 267
    8.6.2.2 Requirement of Adequate Protection ........................................... 268
    8.6.2.3 Allowed Secured Claims Provided for by the Plan ....................... 268
    8.6.2.4 Determining the Amount of an Allowed Secured Claim .............. 269
      8.6.2.4.1 Procedure ........................................................................ 269
      8.6.2.4.2 Valuing motor vehicles .......................................................... 270
      8.6.2.4.3 Valuing property other than automobiles ......................... 271
      8.6.2.4.4 Computation of value ......................................................... 271
  8.6.3 Right to Cure Defaults on Long-Term Debts ................................... 272
8.7 Stripping Down or Stripping Off Liens .................................................. 274
  8.7.1 In General .......................................................................................... 274
  8.7.2 Restrictions in Chapter 7 .................................................................. 274
  8.7.3 Limitations in Chapter 13 ................................................................. 274
    8.7.3.1 In General .................................................................................... 274
    8.7.3.2 Is Negative Equity Owed on Trade-In Vehicle Part of Purchase-Money Obligation for a New Vehicle? ............. 275
      8.7.3.2.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 275
      8.7.3.2.2 The definition of purchase-money security interest .......... 275
      8.7.3.2.3 Courts holding negative equity is part of purchase-money obligation .................................................. 275
      8.7.3.2.4 Courts holding negative equity is not part of purchase-money obligation ........................................... 277
      8.7.3.2.5 Consequences if a portion of the debt is not purchase-money: the transformation rule versus the dual status rule. ................................................................. 278
8.8 Reaffirmation and Security Interests That Survive Bankruptcy ........... 279
  8.8.1 The Reaffirmation Process ............................................................... 279
    8.8.1.1 In General .................................................................................... 279
    8.8.1.2 Requirements for Reaffirmation Agreement and Form 2400A ...... 279
    8.8.1.3 Approval When Consumer Represented by an Attorney .......... 280
    8.8.1.4 Court Review When Consumer Unrepresented ....................... 280
  8.8.2 Reaffirmation and Store Credit Cards ............................................. 281
    8.8.2.1 Secured or Unsecured Debt? ....................................................... 281
Chapter 9  Disposition of Repossessed Collateral Other Than by Creditor’s Sale: Reinstatement, Redemption, Strict Foreclosure, Sheriff’s Sale, and Consumer’s Sale  

9.1 Introduction ......................................................... 289
9.2 Right to Reinstate Contract ........................................ 289
  9.2.1 Comparison of Right to Reinstate with Right to Redeem and Right to Cure  ................................................. 289
  9.2.2 Notice of Right to Reinstate ....................................... 291
  9.2.3 Limits on Right to Reinstate ......................................... 291
  9.2.4 Remedies for Violation of Right to Reinstate ......................... 292
9.3 Redemption of Collateral ................................................ 292
  9.3.1 Nature, Advantages, and Disadvantages of Redemption .......... 292
  9.3.2 Absolute Right Until Disposition .................................... 293
  9.3.3 Debtor’s Continued Ownership of the Collateral During the Redemption Period  ................................................. 294
  9.3.4 Who Can Redeem? .................................................. 295
  9.3.5 Notice of Right to Redeem ............................................ 296
  9.3.6 Determination of Redemption Amount ................................. 297
    9.3.6.1 Components of the Redemption Amount ....................... 297
    9.3.6.2 Requiring the Creditor to Disclose the Redemption Amount ................................................................. 298
    9.3.6.3 Acceleration and the Redemption Amount .................... 299
    9.3.6.4 Multiple Debts; Multiple Items of Collateral .................. 299
  9.3.7 Tender ............................................................ 299
  9.3.8 Remedies for Secured Party’s Violation of Redemption Rights .... 299
  9.3.9 Waiver ............................................................ 300
9.4 Strict Foreclosure: Creditor’s Retention of Collateral ...................... 300
  9.4.1 Deficiency Precluded .............................................. 300
  9.4.2 The 60% Rule: When Is Strict Foreclosure Allowed? .............. 301
  9.4.3 Procedural Steps to Effect Strict Foreclosure ....................... 301
    9.4.3.1 Overview ..................................................... 301
    9.4.3.2 The Debtor’s Consent ........................................... 302
      9.4.3.2.1 Overview; who must consent ................................ 302
      9.4.3.2.2 Consenting by authenticating an agreement ............... 302
      9.4.3.2.3 Consenting by failing to object to a proposal ............. 302
      9.4.3.2.4 Timing requirements and possession of the collateral  . 303
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3.2.5</td>
<td>Should the debtor object?</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3.2.6</td>
<td>Consequences of debtor’s objection</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3.3</td>
<td>Notification of Other Parties</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.4</td>
<td>Consequences of Failure to Comply with Strict Foreclosure Requirements</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.5</td>
<td>Partial Strict Foreclosure</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.6</td>
<td>Good Faith and Deception in Strict Foreclosure</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Judicial Sale of Collateral</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Sale of Collateral by Debtor</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.2</td>
<td>Creditor’s Involvement in Debtor’s Sale May Subject the Sale to Article 9 Requirements</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.3</td>
<td>Effect on Deficiency When Creditor Rejects Offers Obtained by Debtor</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.4</td>
<td>Selling on Consignment</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10</td>
<td>Creditor’s Sale of the Collateral</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Creditor Must Sell, Lease, or Otherwise Dispose of Collateral</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.2</td>
<td>Leases of Repossessed Collateral</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.3</td>
<td>Disposition of Collateral Other Than by Sale or Lease</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Commercial Reasonableness Standard for Repossession Sales</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1</td>
<td>Every Aspect of the Sale Must Be Commercially Reasonable</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2</td>
<td>Definition of Commercial Reasonableness</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.3</td>
<td>Factors in Determining Commercial Reasonableness</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.4</td>
<td>Duty of Commercial Reasonableness Is Not Waivable</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.5</td>
<td>Burden of Proof</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.5.1</td>
<td>Article 9’s Burden of Proof Rules</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.5.2</td>
<td>Burden of Proof When Creditor Seeks Deficiency</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.5.3</td>
<td>Burden of Proof in Debtor’s Affirmative Suit</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.6</td>
<td>Question of Law or Fact</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Creditor’s Duties Toward Collateral</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1</td>
<td>Duty to Safeguard</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2</td>
<td>Use of Collateral</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.3</td>
<td>Duty to Recondition</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.4</td>
<td>Preservation of Warranties</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Notice of Sale</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.1</td>
<td>Importance of Notice</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.2</td>
<td>Who Must Send Notice</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.3</td>
<td>Written Requirement</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.4</td>
<td>Manner of Sending Notice</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.4.1</td>
<td>UCC Definition of “Send”</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.4.2</td>
<td>Electronic Notice</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.5</td>
<td>Few Exceptions to Notification Requirement</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.5.1</td>
<td>Notice Required Regardless of How and When Creditor Acquires Possession</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.5.2</td>
<td>Notice Required Despite Debtor’s Actual Knowledge or Inability to Buy</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.5.3</td>
<td>Narrow Exception When Collateral Is Perishable, Declining in Value, or Sold on “Recognized Market”</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.6</td>
<td>Who Must Receive Notice</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10.4.6.1 Revised Article 9 Requires Notice to Debtors and
Secondary Obligors ........................................... 324
10.4.6.2 Multiple Notices When There Are Multiple Parties;
Notice to Party’s Attorney .................................. 325
10.4.6.3 Effect of Agreement Transferring the Collateral to a
New Buyer ................................................... 325
10.4.7 Waiver of Notice ....................................... 326
10.4.7.1 Debtor’s Waiver of Notice ......................... 326
10.4.7.2 Guarantor’s Waiver of Notice ..................... 327
10.4.8 Timing of Notice ..................................... 327
10.4.8.1 UCC Requirements ................................ 327
10.4.8.2 Requirements Under Other State Statutes ...... 329
10.4.9 Notice Sent But Not Received; Burden of Proving
Notice Was Sent .............................................. 329
10.4.10 Each Co-Debtor and Secondary Obligor Must Receive a
Separate Notice ............................................... 331
10.4.11 Content of Notice .................................... 332
10.4.11.1 Overview .......................................... 332
10.4.11.2 Description of the Debtor and the Secured Party .. 332
10.4.11.3 Description of the Collateral .................... 333
10.4.11.4 Method of Intended Disposition ................. 333
10.4.11.5 Entitlement to Accounting ....................... 334
10.4.11.6 Time and Place of Public Sale or Time After Which
Private Sale Will Be Held .................................... 335
10.4.11.7 Description of Recipient’s Liability for Deficiency 337
10.4.11.8 Telephone Number to Learn Redemption Amount 337
10.4.11.9 Telephone Number or Address for Additional
Information .................................................... 338
10.4.11.10 Model Form ...................................... 338
10.4.11.11 Standard of Accuracy ............................ 338
10.4.11.12 Inclusion of Additional Information in the Notice 339
10.4.11.12.1 Whether the creditor has an obligation to
include additional information ............................ 339
10.4.11.12.2 Inclusion of additional non-required
information that is misleading ............................ 339
10.4.12 Remedies for Notice Violations ..................... 340
10.5 Timing of Sale .......................................... 341
10.5.1 Unreasonable Delay .................................. 341
10.5.2 Constructive Strict Foreclosure and Other Remedies for
Excessive Delay .............................................. 343
10.5.3 Rushed Sale; Choice of Unreasonable Date .......... 343
10.6 Determining If a Sale Is Public or Private ............. 343
10.6.1 Implications of the Distinction Between Public and Private Sales 343
10.6.2 Definitions ............................................. 344
10.6.3 Are Dealer Only Auctions Public or Private Sales? .... 345
10.7 Reasonableness of Choice of Type of Repossession Sale 346
10.7.1 Creditor’s Choice of Manner of Sale Must Be Commercially
Reasonable .................................................. 346
10.7.2 Is It Commercially Reasonable to Dispose of Collateral at
Wholesale? .................................................. 347
10.7.2.1 Article 9 Language Regarding Wholesale Dispositions 347
10.7.2.2 Dealer Justifications for Wholesale Disposition .... 348
Contents

10.7.3 Challenging a Creditor’s Choice of a Private, Non-Auction Wholesale Disposition. ........................................... 349
10.7.4 Challenging Creditor’s Choice of “Dealer Only” Automobile Auction ......................................................... 349
  10.7.4.1 Introduction ................................................................. 349
  10.7.4.2 Dealer Only Automobile Auctions Are Not a “Recognized Market” ....................................................... 350
  10.7.4.3 Dealer Only Automobile Auctions Do Not Conform to “Reasonable Practices Among Dealers in the Type of Property” ................................................................. 350
  10.7.4.4 Evidence of Results of Dealer Only Auctions ............... 350
10.8 Requirements for a Commercially Reasonable Sale ......................... 351
  10.8.1 Introduction .................................................................. 351
  10.8.2 Manner of Conducting an Auction ................................. 351
  10.8.3 Sold to Highest Offer ...................................................... 352
  10.8.4 Location of Sale ........................................................... 352
  10.8.5 Adequate Advertisement ............................................... 352
  10.8.6 Methods Other Than Public Advertising to Attract Buyers .............................................................................. 355
  10.8.7 Availability of Collateral for Inspection ........................... 356
  10.8.8 Need for Appraisal ......................................................... 356
  10.8.9 Good Faith Bargaining Requirement .............................. 357
10.9 Sale Price and Commercial Reasonableness .................................. 357
  10.9.1 Low Price Is a Persistent Problem in Repossession Sales .................................................................................. 357
  10.9.2 Low Price Is a Factor in Commercial Reasonableness and Triggers Special Scrutiny .................................................... 357
  10.9.3 Is the Resale Price a Term of the Sale That Must Be Commercially Reasonable? ....................................................... 359
  10.9.4 Special Statutory Protections Against Below-Market Resale Prices ............................................................... 360
  10.9.5 Determining a Reasonable Sale Price ............................... 361
    10.9.5.1 Using Pricing Guides and Internet Resources to Establish Market Value. .................................................... 361
    10.9.5.2 Purchaser’s Resale Price ................................................... 362
    10.9.5.3 Other Methods to Establish Market Value .................................................. 362
  10.9.6 Rebutting Creditor Justifications for Low Resale Prices ........ 363
10.10 Purchase by Secured Party or Insider, or Pursuant to Recourse Agreement; Revolving Repossession Schemes .......................... 363
  10.10.1 Secured Party May Not Purchase at Private Sale ............... 363
  10.10.2 Secured Party’s Purchase at Sham Public Sale or Commercially Unreasonable Public Sale .................................................. 364
  10.10.3 Low-Price Sales to Insiders ............................................. 365
  10.10.4 Repurchase (Recourse) Agreements ................................. 365
    10.10.4.1 Does Transferring the Obligation or the Collateral Back to the Dealer Constitute the Article 9 Disposition? . . 365
    10.10.4.2 Requirements If Dealer Assumes Secured Party’s Rights and Duties .................................................. 366
  10.10.5 “Churning” or Revolving Repossession Schemes .............. 367
10.11 Rights of Purchasers at Repossession Sales ................................ 368

Chapter 11 Determining the Deficiency or Surplus ................................. 369
11.1 General Rules Regarding Deficiency or Surplus .......................... 369
  11.1.1 Consumer’s Right to Surplus and Liability for Deficiency ................................................................. 369
  11.1.2 Consumer’s Right to a Surplus .......................................... 369

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library

xxv
11.1.2.1 Right to Surplus After Sale of Collateral .......................... 369
11.1.2.2 Right to Surplus When Creditor Retains Collateral
(Strict Foreclosure) ........................................ 369
11.1.2.3 Consumer Remedies for Creditor’s Failure to
Pay Surplus .................................................. 370
11.2 Deficiency or Surplus Calculation Must Be Explained to Consumer .... 370
  11.2.1 General .................................................. 370
  11.2.2 Form and Content of Explanation ................................ 371
  11.2.3 Remedies for Failure to Comply .................................. 372
11.3 Calculating the Deficiency or Surplus ..................................... 372
  11.3.1 Introduction ............................................. 372
  11.3.2 The Balance Due on the Debt ...................................... 372
    11.3.2.1 The Remainder Due on the Debt Before Adjustments .... 372
    11.3.2.2 Unearned Interest Rebates ................................. 373
      11.3.2.2.1 Acceleration treated as prepayment in computing rebates .... 373
      11.3.2.2.2 Computing interest rebates .......................... 374
      11.3.2.2.3 The effect of the consumer’s waiver of the right to a rebate .... 374
      11.3.2.2.4 Consumer remedies for failure to rebate unearned interest .... 374
    11.3.2.3 Interest and Penalties After Acceleration ......................... 374
    11.3.2.4 Force-Placed Insurance Premiums Hidden in a Revised Payment Schedule ........................................ 375
    11.3.2.5 Credits to the Consumer for Insurance Claim Payments .... 375
  11.3.3 Insurance Rebates ............................................. 375
  11.3.4 Credit to Consumer for Collateral’s Value .......................... 376
    11.3.4.1 Introduction .......................................... 376
    11.3.4.2 Transactions Not Qualifying As UCC Sales ....................... 376
    11.3.4.3 When Sale Involves Additional Property or Charges ............ 377
    11.3.4.4 When Collateral Purchased in Part with a Trade-In or Other Non-Cash Proceeds ........................................ 377
  11.3.5 Determining the Collateral’s Value After Disposition to an Insider .... 378
    11.3.5.1 Special Rule for Determining Value ............................ 378
    11.3.5.2 Who Is an Insider? ....................................... 378
    11.3.5.3 Practical Applications of the Insider Rules ...................... 379
    11.3.5.4 Consumer Remedies for Insider Sales .......................... 380
    11.3.5.5 Proof Issues ............................................ 381
      11.3.5.5.1 The burden of proof generally .......................... 381
      11.3.5.5.2 Burden of proof for consumer transactions ................. 381
      11.3.5.5.3 Evidence as to the range of prices at an arm’s length sale .... 381
  11.3.6 Deductions for Repossession-Related Expenses ......................... 382
    11.3.6.1 Expenses of Seizing and Storing the Collateral ................. 382
    11.3.6.2 Expenses of Reconditioning or Repairing the Collateral ....... 383
      11.3.6.2.1 When such expenses are valid .......................... 383
      11.3.6.2.2 Computing creditor expenses .......................... 383
    11.3.6.3 Selling Expenses ........................................ 384
    11.3.6.4 Attorney Fees .......................................... 385
      11.3.6.4.1 General .............................................. 385
      11.3.6.4.2 Does the contract authorize attorney fees? ................. 385
Chapter 12

Defending a Deficiency Action

12.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 387
  12.1.1 Importance of Defending a Deficiency Action .................................................. 387
  12.1.2 How to Approach Defending a Deficiency Action .............................................. 387

12.2 Creditor’s Right to a Deficiency

  12.2.1 General .................................................................................................................. 388
  12.2.2 Creditor Can Both Seize Collateral and Sue on Debt ........................................... 389
    12.2.2.1 Creditor’s Right to Exercise Remedies Simultaneously and Cumulatively .... 389
    12.2.2.2 Limits on Creditor’s Exercise of Multiple Remedies ...................................... 390
    12.2.2.2.1 UCC duties of good faith and commercial reasonableness; constructive strict
                  foreclosure ............................................................................................................. 390
    12.2.2.2.2 Other state law restrictions ............................................................................. 391
    12.2.2.2.3 Restrictions against double recovery ............................................................ 391

12.3 No Deficiency When Underlying Debt Is Extinguished ........................................ 392
  12.3.1 General .................................................................................................................. 392
  12.3.2 Payment to Assignee ............................................................................................. 392
  12.3.3 Creditor’s Promise to Accept Collateral in Satisfaction of Debt ......................... 394
  12.3.4 No Deficiency After Revocation of Acceptance ................................................... 394

12.4 State Anti-Deficiency Statutes .................................................................................. 395
  12.4.1 Overview ............................................................................................................... 395
  12.4.2 Dollar Limitations on Anti-Deficiency Statutes .................................................... 396
  12.4.3 Are Consumer Loans or Only Credit Sales Covered? ......................................... 397
  12.4.4 Type of Goods Covered; Cross-Collateral .............................................................. 398
  12.4.5 The Illinois Statute’s Scope .................................................................................... 398
  12.4.6 Excessive Damage to the Collateral May Give Rise to a Creditor Cause of Action .... 399
  12.4.7 Effect of Anti-Deficiency Statute on Judicial Sale of Property Pursuant to a Judgment
                  Lien .......................................................................................................................... 399
  12.4.8 Has the Creditor Made an Election? ..................................................................... 399
  12.4.9 Remedies Under Anti-Deficiency Judgment Statutes ......................................... 400

12.5 Creditor’s Actions May Preclude a Deficiency: Constructive Strict Foreclosure,
    Estoppel, Waiver, and Related Theories ......................................................................... 400
  12.5.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 400
  12.5.2 Constructive Strict Foreclosure Under Former Article 9 ..................................... 400
  12.5.3 Overview of Constructive Strict Foreclosure Under Revised Article 9 .................. 400
  12.5.4 Creditor’s Sale of Collateral to Itself .................................................................... 401
  12.5.5 Wrongful Use of Collateral ................................................................................... 401
  12.5.6 Abandoning Collateral As Worthless .................................................................... 402
  12.5.7 Delay in Sale of Collateral ..................................................................................... 402
  12.5.8 Absolute Bar As an Alternative Theory .................................................................. 403
  12.5.9 Theories When Creditor Leads Consumer to Believe That Return of Collateral Will
                  Discharge the Debt ................................................................................................. 404
    12.5.9.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................... 404
    12.5.9.2 Estoppel ........................................................................................................... 404
    12.5.9.3 Waiver ............................................................................................................. 404
12.5.9.4  Accord and Satisfaction ................................. 405
12.5.9.5  Rescission and Satisfaction .......................... 406

12.6  Defective Disposition As Defense to Deficiency Action .................. 406
12.6.1  Creditor’s Burden and Overview of Consumer Remedies When Burden Not Met ........................................... 406
12.6.1.1  Burden on Creditor to Prove All Aspects of Sale Commercially Reasonable ..................................... 406
12.6.1.2  Must the Consumer Place the Secured Party’s Compliance with Article 9 in Issue? ...................... 409
12.6.1.3  What Evidence Is Necessary to Meet the Creditor’s Burden? ...................................................... 409
12.6.1.4  Impact of Defective Disposition on Right to Deficiency ................................................................. 411
12.6.2  The Absolute Bar Approach .................................... 411
12.6.2.1  States Adopting the Absolute Bar Rule ................. 411
12.6.2.2  Violations Triggering the Absolute Bar ................. 412
12.6.2.3  Operation of the Absolute Bar Rule ..................... 412
12.6.2.4  Justification for the Absolute Bar Rule .................. 413
12.6.3  The Rebuttable Presumption Theory .......................... 414
12.6.3.1  General ..................................................... 414
12.6.3.2  Distinguishing Rebuttable Presumption Precedent in Arguing for an Absolute Bar Approach ............. 414
12.6.3.3  Operation of the Rebuttable Presumption Approach ........ 414
12.6.4  The Set-Off Theory ........................................... 415
12.6.5  State-by-State Survey .......................................... 416
12.6.6  Effect on Right to Deficiency of Failure to Send Explanation of Calculations ........................................ 425
12.6.7  Special Protections Against Deficiency Judgments Under Navajo and Other Tribal Law ............................... 426

12.7  Statute of Limitations for Creditor’s Deficiency Claim .................... 427

12.8  Procedural Defenses, State Notice Requirements, and Elements of Creditor’s Claim ........................................... 428
12.8.1  Is the Plaintiff the Correct Party? ............................ 428
12.8.2  Special Notice Requirements As Precondition to a Deficiency .......... 430
12.8.3  Special Pleading and Venue Requirements .................. 432
12.8.4  Elements Creditor Must Prove ................................ 432

12.9  Cosigners and Other Sureties’ Defenses to Deficiency Action .............. 433
12.9.1  Introduction ................................................... 433
12.9.1.1  Nature of Cosigner’s Liability ................................ 433
12.9.1.2  Cosigner’s Right to Assert Defenses the Principal Obligor Could Assert ........................................ 434
12.9.1.3  Special Defenses and Protections for Cosigners; Does Article 3 or the Common Law Govern? .................. 435
12.9.2  Cosigner Definition Under Article 3 ............................ 435
12.9.2.1  Introduction ................................................ 435
12.9.2.2  Definition of Accommodation Party Under 1990 and 2002 Versions of Article 3 ................................. 436
12.9.2.3  Definitions Under Pre-1990 Version of Article 3 ........... 437
12.9.3  Defenses Available to Cosigners Under Article 3 ...................... 437
12.9.3.1  General ..................................................... 437
12.9.3.2  1990 Version of Article 3 .................................... 438
12.9.3.2.1  Extension of due date .................................... 438
12.9.3.2.2  Modification of terms of obligation ..................... 438
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.2.3</td>
<td>Creditor’s impairment of collateral</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.2.4</td>
<td>Release of principal obligor</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.2.5</td>
<td>Waiver</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.2.6</td>
<td>Defenses when accommodation party’s status is unknown to creditor</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.3</td>
<td>Defenses Under 2002 Revisions to Article 3</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.4</td>
<td>Defenses in New York</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.4.1</td>
<td>Payment extensions and other modifications of terms</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.4.2</td>
<td>Impairment of collateral as defense to deficiency</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.3.4.3</td>
<td>Reservation of rights may defeat these defenses</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.4</td>
<td>Defenses Available to Cosigners Under the Common Law</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.4.1</td>
<td>Relevance of Common Law Rules</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.4.2</td>
<td>Discharge of Guarantor Under Common Law Rules</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.4.3</td>
<td>Creditor’s Failure to Reveal Risks of Guarantee as Defense to Deficiency</td>
<td>444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.5</td>
<td>Cosigners’ Rights Under UCC Articles 1 and 9</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.5.1</td>
<td>Cosigner’s Right to Notice of Sale and a Commercially Reasonable Disposition of the Collateral</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.5.1.1</td>
<td>Cosigners as “secondary obligors” under Article 9</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.5.1.2</td>
<td>Cosigners’ rights after repossession</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.5.2</td>
<td>Creditor’s Duty of Good Faith to Surety</td>
<td>446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.6</td>
<td>Creditor’s Duty to Make Disclosures to Cosigner</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.6.1</td>
<td>Federal Trade Commission Cosigner Requirements</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.6.2</td>
<td>State Cosigner Statutes</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.7</td>
<td>Surety’s Claims Against the Principal Debtor</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.8</td>
<td>Representing Victims of Coerced Debt</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.8.1</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.8.2</td>
<td>Safety Considerations</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.8.3</td>
<td>Considerations Prior to Vehicle Repossession</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.9.8.4</td>
<td>Defending a Deficiency Action</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.10</td>
<td>Raising Defenses to FDIC or RTC Deficiency Actions</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 13

**Affirmative Consumer Remedies in Repossession Cases**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>UCC § 9-625 Remedies</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.1</td>
<td>In General</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.2</td>
<td>Injunctive Relief</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.3</td>
<td>Actual Damages</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.3.1</td>
<td>Availability of Actual Damages</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.3.2</td>
<td>Components of Actual Damages; Attorney Fees</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.4</td>
<td>Statutory Damages Under UCC § 9-625(c)(2)</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.4.1</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.4.2</td>
<td>Violations Leading to Statutory Damages</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.4.3</td>
<td>Are Statutory Damages Available for Violation of Non-UCC Requirements?</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2.4.4</td>
<td>Who May Seek Statutory Damages?</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13.2.4.5 Statutory Damages Available Only If Collateral Is Consumer Goods 458
13.2.4.6 Calculation of Statutory Damages 458
13.2.5 Supplemental $500 Damages for Miscellaneous Violations 459
13.2.6 Class Actions, Multiple Statutory Damages, and Interrelation with Other Damage Awards 460
  13.2.6.1 Class Actions 460
  13.2.6.2 Multiple Statutory Damages 461
  13.2.6.3 Can the Consumer Recover Both UCC Statutory Damages and Actual, Statutory, or Punitive Damages Under Non-UCC Law? 461
13.2.7 Barring a Deficiency and Recovering UCC Actual and Statutory Damages 462
  13.2.7.1 Overview 462
  13.2.7.2 Effect on Actual and Statutory Damages When Debtor Has Defeated Deficiency Claim in Non-Consumer Transaction or in Non-Uniform State 462
  13.2.7.3 Effect on Actual and Statutory Damages When Debtor Has Defeated Deficiency Claim in Consumer Transaction in Uniform State 463
  13.2.7.4 When Non-UCC State Law Specifically Bars Deficiency 464
  13.2.7.5 Practical Considerations 464
13.2.8 Statute of Limitations for Claims Under § 9-625 465
  13.2.8.1 What Limitations Period Applies 465
  13.2.8.2 Tolling and the Discovery Rule; When the Statute of Limitations Begins to Run 466
13.3 Violation of the UCC’s Good Faith Requirement 466
  13.3.1 Application of Good Faith Requirement to Repossession Cases 466
  13.3.2 Remedies for Violation of Good Faith Requirement 468
13.4 UDAP, RICO, and Unconscionability 470
  13.4.1 Overview of UDAP Remedy 470
  13.4.2 UDAP Statutes’ Coverage of Repossession Practices 471
    13.4.2.1 Importance of Examining the Statutory Language 471
    13.4.2.2 Determining If UDAP Statute Applies to Repossession and Collection Practices 471
    13.4.2.3 Determining If UDAP Statute Applies to Credit Transactions 472
  13.4.3 Unfair and Deceptive Repossession Practices 472
    13.4.3.1 Specific Practices Found Unfair or Deceptive 472
    13.4.3.2 Violation of Other Statute As Basis for UDAP Violation 475
    13.4.3.3 Contractual Creditor Remedy Provisions As UDAP Violations 475
    13.4.3.4 Remedies and Limitations in UDAP Repossession Cases 475
  13.4.4 Federal and State RICO and Civil Theft Claims 476
  13.4.5 Unconscionability 477
13.5 Laws Regulating Repossessions, Collections, or Credit 477
  13.5.1 The Federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act 477
    13.5.1.1 Overview 477
    13.5.1.2 FDCPA Provisions Specifically Covering Repossession Companies 478
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.2.1 Scope</td>
<td>478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.2.2 Seizing collateral without present right to the property</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.2.3 Threatening repossession without a present intent to repossess</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.2.4 Repossession of property exempt by law from seizure</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.3.1 Do the Generally Applicable FDCPA Prohibitions Apply to Repossession?</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.3.2 The statutory definition of “debt collector” and the <em>Obduskey</em> decision</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.3.3 Applying the “principal purpose” requirement of the limited-purpose definition</td>
<td>481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.1.3.4 Repossessor’s acts that go beyond those necessary to enforce a security interest</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.2 State Debt Collection Laws</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.3 Truth in Lending Act</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.4 State Consumer Credit Statutes</td>
<td>485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.5 State Limits on Professional Repossessors</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5.6 State Criminal Laws</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 Common Law Tort, Replevin, and Contract Claims</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.1 Overview of Tort Claims</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.2 Conversion and Trespass to Chattels</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.2.1 Elements of Conversion</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.2.2 Application of the Tort of Conversion to Repossession</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.2.3 Trespass to Chattels</td>
<td>494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.3 Negligence</td>
<td>495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.4 Trespass and Invasion of Privacy</td>
<td>495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.5 Assaults and Related Torts</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.6 Negligent or Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress</td>
<td>498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.7 Defamation</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.8 Misrepresentation</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.9 Other Potential Tort Causes of Action</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.10 Actual Damages in Tort</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.11 Punitive Damages</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.12 Debtor’s Replevin of Wrongfully Seized Property</td>
<td>505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.13 Contract Claims</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7 Civil Rights Violations and Constitutional Remedies</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.2 Cause of Action for Civil Rights Violations</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3 Potential Defendants in Civil Rights Actions</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3.2 The State’s Sovereign Immunity</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3.3 Liability of Local Governmental Bodies</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3.4 Individual Law Enforcement Officers and Qualified Good Faith Immunity</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7.3.5 Liability of Private Parties</td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.8 U.S. Bankruptcy Code</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Repossessions

13.9 Consumer Remedies Based on Claims or Counterclaims Not Related to the Repossession

13.9.1 Types of Claims to Raise

13.9.2 Raising Seller-Related Claims Against the Creditor

13.9.2.1 Scope and Effect of the FTC Holder Rule

13.9.2.2 Limits on Creditor Liability for Seller-Related Claims

13.10 Creditor Defenses

13.10.1 Debtor’s Consent As Defense to Wrongful Repossession

13.10.2 Debtor’s Contractual Waiver of Action for Wrongful Repossession

13.10.3 Contractual Waivers of Consumer’s Right to Sue for Personal Property Taken with the Collateral

13.10.4 Creditor’s Liability for the Acts of Repossessors

13.10.4.1 Employer’s Respondeat Superior Liability

13.10.4.2 When Repossessor Is an Independent Contractor

13.10.4.2.1 Care in repossession of collateral as a non-delegable duty

13.10.4.2.2 Creditor’s failure to exercise care in selecting a contractor

13.10.4.2.3 Creditor liability based on other statutes

13.10.4.3 Liability of Repossession Company or Other Third Parties

13.11 Litigation Issues

13.11.1 Long-Arm Jurisdiction in Repossession Cases

13.11.2 Pleadings and Discovery

13.11.3 Arbitration Requirements

13.11.3.1 Introduction

13.11.3.2 A Dozen Reasons Why Arbitration May Not Be Required

13.11.3.2.1 No arbitration requirement for manufactured home loans

13.11.3.2.2 No arbitration requirement for non-purchase-money credit extended to military personnel or dependents

13.11.3.2.3 Congress overrides CFPB limits on mandatory arbitration

13.11.3.2.4 Arbitration when consumer files bankruptcy

13.11.3.2.5 Defendant must produce the arbitration agreement

13.11.3.2.6 When the sole designated arbitration forum is unavailable

13.11.3.2.7 Has the arbitration agreement been superseded by another contract?

13.11.3.2.8 Has the creditor waived the arbitration requirement?

13.11.3.2.9 Unconscionability or denial of federal statutory rights

13.11.3.2.10 Does the arbitration agreement apply to the dispute and to the parties?
Contents

13.11.3.2.11 When arbitration clause excludes self-help remedies .............................................. 523
13.11.3.2.12 When usury voids the contract ................................................................. 524
13.11.3.3 Does the Court or Arbitrator Determine Arbitrability? ...................................... 524
13.11.3.4 When Arbitration May Be a Good Consumer Option ........................................ 524
13.11.3.4.1 Class arbitration ......................................................................................... 524
13.11.3.4.2 Individual arbitration .............................................................................. 525
13.11.3.4.3 Punitive damages ...................................................................................... 525
13.11.4 Voir Dire .............................................................................................................. 525
13.11.5 Burden of Proof ................................................................................................. 526
13.11.6 Settlement .......................................................................................................... 526
13.11.7 Attorney Fees .................................................................................................... 526

Chapter 14
Consumer Leases ............................................................................................................. 527
14.1 General ...................................................................................................................... 527
14.1.1 Scope of This Chapter ......................................................................................... 527
14.1.2 When Is a Lease Covered by UCC Article 9? .................................................. 528
14.1.2.1 Introduction .................................................................................................... 528
14.1.2.2 History of UCC Definition of Security Interest ......................................... 528
14.1.2.3 Standards for Distinguishing Between Security Interest and Lease .......... 528
14.1.2.3.1 General ....................................................................................................... 528
14.1.2.3.2 Bright-line rule that some non-terminable leases are security agreements. 528
14.1.2.3.3 When is additional consideration considered nominal? ..................... 529
14.1.2.3.4 Examples of leases that meet the bright-line test .................................. 530
14.1.2.3.5 Lease can still be a security agreement if the bright-line rule does not apply 530
14.1.3 Applicable Law When Article 9 Does Not Apply .............................................. 532
14.1.3.1 UCC Article 2A .......................................................................................... 532
14.1.3.2 The Federal Consumer Leasing Act ............................................................... 532
14.1.3.3 State Consumer Statutes Governing Leases ................................................. 533
14.1.3.4 State Deceptive Practices and Debt Collection Statutes ............................. 534

14.2 Automobile Leases .................................................................................................. 534
14.2.1 Does Article 9 or Article 2A Regulate Automobile Lease Repossessions? ........ 534
14.2.1.1 General ........................................................................................................ 534
14.2.1.2 Closed-End Automobile Leases ................................................................ 534
14.2.1.3 Open-End Automobile Leases .................................................................. 535
14.2.1.4 Rent-to-Own Automobile Transactions .................................................... 535
14.2.2 Types of Default Giving Lessor the Right to Repossess .................................... 536
14.2.2.1 Lease Agreement Defines What Conduct Results in Default .................... 536
14.2.2.2 Not All Defaults Justify Repossession ......................................................... 536
14.2.2.3 Limits on Lessor’s Ability to Accelerate Lease Payments .......................... 536
14.2.2.4 Other State Law Restrictions on When Lessor Can Repossess the Vehicle 537
14.2.2.5 Protections for Lessees in Military Service .................................................. 537
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2</td>
<td>Protection against self-help repossession</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2</td>
<td>Right to seek stay of enforcement of lease</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.3</td>
<td>Right to Cure Default or Reinstate Lease</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.4</td>
<td>Repossession Must Not Breach the Peace</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.5</td>
<td>Sale of Leased Vehicle After Repossession</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6</td>
<td>Understanding How Lessors Compute Consumers’ Default and Early Termination Liability</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6.2</td>
<td>Key Terms</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6.3</td>
<td>Lessor’s Core Damages, Expressed as Difference Between Actual and Paid-In Depreciation</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6.4</td>
<td>The Adjusted Lease Balance Method</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.6.5</td>
<td>Calculations Based on Remaining Lease Payments Plus the Residual Value</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.7</td>
<td>Actual Liability Computations Often Deviate from Method Required by the Lease</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.7.1</td>
<td>Reasons for Deviations</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.7.2</td>
<td>Remedies When Method Utilized Deviates from That Disclosed in the Lease</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8</td>
<td>Excessive Residual Values and Inadequate Realized Values</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.1</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.2</td>
<td>Realized Value Must Exceed the Residual Value</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.3</td>
<td>Inflated Residual Values</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.4</td>
<td>Manufacturer “Supported” Residual Values</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.5</td>
<td>Use of a Sale Price to Determine the Realized Value</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.5.1</td>
<td>Using sale price is an inappropriate way to compute an early termination charge</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.5.2</td>
<td>Does Regulation M condone using a sale price to compute an early termination charge?</td>
<td>546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.5.3</td>
<td>Sale price, if used, should be reasonable.</td>
<td>546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.6</td>
<td>Approaches to Avoiding a Sale to Determine Realized Value</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.7</td>
<td>Double Counting of Excess Use and Wear Charges</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.8</td>
<td>Selling Expenses Should Not Be Charged to the Lessee</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.8.9</td>
<td>When Formula Fails to Provide Credit for Realized Value</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9</td>
<td>Other Limitations on Early Termination Charges</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.1</td>
<td>Capitalized Cost Manipulation</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.2</td>
<td>Rebate of Third-Party Charges</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.3</td>
<td>Extra Penalties</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.4</td>
<td>Taxes Not Paid to Taxing Authority</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.5</td>
<td>Servicemember’s Right to Terminate a Vehicle Lease</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.5.1</td>
<td>When lease entered into prior to active duty military service</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.5.2</td>
<td>When lease entered into while on active duty military service</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.6</td>
<td>Limits on Consumer Liability After Vehicle Loss</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.7</td>
<td>Limit on Early Termination Liability After Consumer’s Death</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.9.8</td>
<td>Failure to Credit the Security Deposit or Interest on the Security Deposit</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 14

14.2.10 Consumer Remedies for Unreasonable Early Termination Charges . 550
14.2.10.1 UCC Article 2A ........................................................................ 550
14.2.10.2 Federal Consumer Leasing Act .................................................. 551
14.2.10.3 State Leasing Statutes ............................................................... 552
14.2.10.4 Relation of Federal and State Law Standards ......................... 552
14.2.11 Other Defenses Against the Lessor’s Claim for an Early Termination Penalty ................................................................. 552
14.2.11.1 Statute of Limitations for Lessor’s Collection of Early Termination Liability .......................................................... 552
14.2.11.2 Is the Real Party in Interest Bringing the Suit? ....................... 552
14.2.11.3 Raising Other Claims and Defenses Against the Lessor’s Collection Action ................................................................. 553

14.3 Rent-to-Own Transactions ................................................................. 553
14.3.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 553
14.3.2 Does Article 9 Apply? ................................................................. 554
  14.3.2.1 Has the State Enacted a Statute Exempting RTO Transactions from Article 9? .............................................................. 554
  14.3.2.2 If RTO Transactions Are Not Explicitly Exempt, Do They Meet Article 9’s Coverage Requirements? .................... 556
14.3.3 Do State Retail Installment Sales Acts Apply to RTO Transactions? .................................................................................. 557
14.3.4 Application of Article 2A ............................................................... 558
14.3.5 Application of Federal Consumer Leasing and Truth in Lending Acts to RTO ................................................................. 558
14.3.6 Limitations on Seizure of RTO Goods ........................................... 559
  14.3.6.1 Article 2A’s Prohibition on Seizures That Breach the Peace ........ 559
  14.3.6.2 RTO Tactics for Gaining Entry into a Consumer’s Home ............ 559
  14.3.6.3 Principal’s Liability for Breaches of the Peace ......................... 560
  14.3.6.4 Potential Tort and UDAP Claims ............................................. 561
  14.3.6.5 Application of State Consumer Credit Statutes ....................... 561
  14.3.6.6 Application of the Servicemembers Civil Relief Act and State Counterparts .............................................................. 561
  14.3.6.7 Bankruptcy Stay .................................................................. 561
  14.3.6.8 Discrimination .................................................................... 561
14.3.7 Consumer’s Right of Reinstatement .............................................. 562
14.3.8 RTO Company and Consumer Liability After Repossession ............ 562
14.3.9 Criminal Charges and Threats of Arrest ......................................... 563

Chapter 15

15.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 567
15.2 Common Law Liens ......................................................................... 568
15.3 Construction of Lien Statutes ............................................................ 569
15.4 Persons Who May Claim a Lien on Property ....................................... 570
15.5 Services and Charges That May Establish a Lien ................................ 571
  15.5.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 571
  15.5.2 Labor and Skill ....................................................................... 572
  15.5.3 Enhancement of Value of Property ............................................. 572
  15.5.4 Lien Is for Reasonable or Agreed-Upon Charges ....................... 573
15.6 Property Subject to a Lien ............................................................... 575
  15.6.1 Types of Property Specified by Statute ....................................... 575

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
15.6.2 Property May Be Subject to a Common Law Lien .......................... 576
15.6.3 A Lien Exists Only on the Property upon Which Work Has
    Been Performed .................................................. 576
15.7 Consumer Must Consent to the Services ............................................. 576
15.7.1 General ................................................................. 576
15.7.2 What Constitutes Valid Consent? ................................................. 577
15.7.3 Parties Who May Consent ......................................................... 578
15.7.4 Special Case of Constable’s Storage of Evicted Tenant’s Property ...... 579
    15.7.4.1 General ............................................................... 579
    15.7.4.2 Warehouseman’s Rights Under UCC Article 7 ...................... 580
    15.7.4.3 Article 7 Allows Warehouseman to Sell the Property,
        Without Retaining the Proceeds ....................................... 580
15.8 The Lienholder’s Surrender of the Lien Property May Extinguish the Lien 581
15.8.1 When Surrender of Possession Extinguishes Lien ......................... 581
15.8.2 When Surrender of Possession Does Not Extinguish Lien ............... 582
15.8.3 Special Case of “Auto Repair” Lenders ........................................ 583
15.9 Lienholder’s Waiver of Lien ............................................................ 584
15.10 Consumer’s Tender As Dissolving a Lien .......................................... 585
15.11 Lien Sales ..................................................................................... 586
    15.11.1 No Right to Sell Property for Common Law Lien ....................... 586
    15.11.2 Sale Requirements of State Lien Statutes ................................. 586
    15.11.3 Special Protections for Active Duty Servicemembers ................ 587
15.12 Conduct of Sale ............................................................................... 587
15.13 Constitutional Challenges to Lien Enforcement .................................. 588
    15.13.1 Does the Lien Sale Involve State Action? ................................. 588
    15.13.2 Procedural Protections Required by Due Process ...................... 589
    15.13.3 Towing Cases ......................................................................... 590
15.14 Consumer Remedies ....................................................................... 593
    15.14.1 Conversion ............................................................................ 593
    15.14.2 Obtaining Release of the Property ............................................ 595
    15.14.3 UDAP Remedies ..................................................................... 596
    15.14.4 Remedies When Lienholder Damages Property .......................... 597
    15.14.5 Other Remedies ....................................................................... 597

Appendix A  Selected Uniform Commercial Code Provisions .......................... 599
A.1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 599
A.2 Selected Provisions of Article 1 Relating to Consumer Repossessions .......... 599
A.3 Selected Provisions of Article 2A Relating to Consumer Repossessions ....... 609
A.4 Selected Provisions of Article 3 Relating to Consumer Repossessions ........ 619
    A.4.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 619
    A.4.2 1990 Version of Article 3 ......................................................... 619
    A.4.3 2002 Revised Version of Article 3 ........................................... 624
A.5 Article 9 .............................................................................................. 630
    A.5.1 Selected Provisions of Revised Article 9 Relating to Consumer
        Repossessions ........................................................................ 630
    A.5.2 Conversion Tables ...................................................................... 688
        A.5.2.1 Table of Disposition of Sections in Former Article 9
            and Other Code Sections .................................................. 688
        A.5.2.2 Table Indicating Sources or Derivations of New
            Article 9 Sections and Conforming Amendments .............. 690
        A.5.2.3 Conforming Amendments to Other Code Sections
            and Comments .............................................................. 692

xxvi Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
## Contents

### Appendix B
Summary of State Repossession Laws ........................................... 693

### Appendix C
Federal Statutes and Regulations Relevant to Repossession .................. 729

C.3 Selected Provisions of the Servicemembers Civil Relief Act, 50 U.S.C. §§ 3901–4043 ........................................... 730
C.5 Regulations for Federally-Related Mortgages, 12 C.F.R. Part 190 ............. 741

### Appendix D
Sample Answers and Complaints .................................................... 745

D.1 Sample Answer and Counterclaims to Deficiency Action ..................... 745
D.2 Additional Defenses and Counterclaims Based on Sale to Insider .......... 750
D.3 Sample Complaint Alleging Violation of 42 U.S.C. § 1983, Conversion, and Breach of Peace ........................................... 751
D.4 Sample Complaint Alleging FDCPA, UCC, Civil Rights, and State Tort Claims .................................................... 752
D.5 Sample Class Action Complaint Alleging Churning ............................. 755
D.6 Sample Complaint for Replevin and Emergency Motion for Return of Vehicle .................................................... 760
  D.6.1 Sample Complaint for Replevin and Damages ............................. 760
  D.6.2 Brief in Support of Emergency Motion for Return of Property .......... 761
D.7 Sample Complaint to Enjoin Sale .................................................. 762

### Appendix E
Sample Repossession Discovery and Request for Admissions ..................... 763

E.1 Sample First Set of Interrogatories ............................................. 763
E.2 Sample Document Request ...................................................... 766
E.3 Sample Supplemental Interrogatories for Dealer Only Auto Auction ......... 767
E.4 Sample Second Document Request ............................................. 768
E.5 Sample Interrogatories for Repossessor, Finance Company, and Police in a Breach of the Peace Case ........................................... 769
E.6 Sample Requests for Production of Documents for Repossessor, Finance Company, and Police in a Breach of the Peace Case ............. 771
E.7 Sample Request for Admissions Regarding Vehicle Valuation ................. 772

Index ......................................................................................... 773