Contents

Part I General

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 About This Treatise .................................................. 1
1.1.1 All Subscribers Have Access to the Online Version ............ 1
1.1.2 Topics Covered in This Treatise .................................. 1
1.2 This Treatise’s Organization ........................................ 2
1.2.1 Debt Defense Checklist ............................................ 2
1.2.2 Chapters 2–6: General Consumer Defenses ....................... 2
1.2.3 Chapters 7–11: Defenses to Special Types of Debt ................. 3
1.2.4 Chapters 12–17: Creditor and Consumer Postjudgment Rights .... 3
1.2.5 The Appendices ...................................................... 4
1.2.6 Additional Pleadings, Practice Tools, and Primary Source Materials Found Online ......................... 4
1.3 Additional NCLC Resources ........................................ 4
1.4 Debt-Defense Checklist ............................................. 5
1.4.1 Type of Debt ....................................................... 5
1.4.2 Status of Collection Lawsuit ..................................... 5
1.4.3 Debtor’s and Creditor’s Rights After Judgment for Creditor .... 6
1.5 Debt Buyers and Collection Lawsuits ............................. 6
1.5.1 Dramatic Growth in Debt Buying .................................. 6
1.5.2 Debt Buyers Identified ............................................. 7
1.5.3 The Nature of Debt Sales to Debt Buyers .......................... 7
1.5.4 Resulting Explosion in Collection Litigation ......................... 8
1.5.5 Characteristics of Debt Buyer Collection Lawsuits ................. 8

Chapter 2 Case Selection, Advising the Client, and Litigation Strategy

2.1 Ten Reasons to Represent Consumer Debtors in Defending Collection Lawsuits ........................................... 11
2.1.1 Reason #1: Consumers Often Have Dispositive Defenses ......... 11
2.1.2 Reason #2: Stopping Systematic Abuse of the Justice System and Educating Judges ..................... 12
2.1.3 Reason #3: Counterclaims Can Result in the Recovery of Damages and Attorney Fees ...................... 12
2.1.4 Reason #4: Prevailing in the Collection Action Can Improve a Consumer’s Credit Rating ......................... 13
2.1.5 Reason #5: Alleviation of Emotional Distress ..................... 13
2.1.6 Reason #6: Protection of the Consumer’s Assets and Income ..... 13
2.1.7 Reason #7: Collection Clients Often Have TCPA, FDCPA, FCRA, and Other Consumer Claims .................. 13
2.1.8 Reason #8: Debt Collector May Have to Pay the Consumer’s Attorney Fees ........................................ 13
2.1.9 Reason #9: Development of Expertise and a Name in the Community ........................................... 13
2.1.10 Reason #10: Defending Against a Collection Action Allows for a Class Action to Stay in State Court ............... 13
Chapter 3  Dismissal Before Reaching the Merits

3.1  Introduction .................................................................................. 31
3.2  Has the Collector Chosen an Appropriate Forum? .......................... 31
   3.2.1  Does the Court Have Jurisdiction? ........................................ 31
   3.2.2  Venue .................................................................................... 31
      3.2.2.1  Limitations on State Court Venue .................................. 31
      3.2.2.2  Implications of a Collection Suit Brought in Violation
               of Federal or State Limits .................................................. 32
   3.2.3  When a Collection Action Is Brought Before an Arbitrator .......... 32
   3.2.4  Forcing the Collector to Bring the Action Before an Arbitrator .... 32
3.3 Is the Collector Qualified to Bring an Action in the State’s Courts? .......................... 34
  3.3.1 Introduction ................................................................. 34
  3.3.2 When Collector or Its Assignor Is a Foreign Corporation ................................. 34
    3.3.2.1 When Collector Is a Foreign Corporation ........................................ 34
    3.3.2.2 When Registered Collector Buys Debt from Unregistered Foreign Corporation 34
  3.3.3 Can Collector Sue Under a Fictitious Name? ................................................. 34
  3.3.4 Partnership’s Capacity to Sue in Its Own Name ............................................. 35
  3.3.5 Licensure As a Precondition to a Collection Action ....................................... 35
    3.3.5.1 Licensure As Precondition to Collection Action? .................................. 35
    3.3.5.2 Must Debt Buyers Comply with Debt Collector Licensing Requirements? ............ 35
    3.3.5.3 State Law Requiring Debt Buyers to Be Licensed As Debt Buyers ....................... 37
  3.3.6 Champerty and Other Limits on Suits on Assigned Debt .................................. 37
  3.3.7 Can an Attorney Function As a Debt Buyer? .................................................. 38
  3.3.8 Requirement That a Collector Retain an Attorney to Bring Suit .......................... 38
  3.3.9 Requirements Concerning the Collection Attorney ......................................... 38
  3.4 Defects on the Face of the Complaint ............................................................. 39
    3.4.1 Introduction ............................................................................ 39
    3.4.2 Required Pleading That Collector Entitled to Bring the Action ......................... 39
      3.4.2.1 Allegations Present in the Complaint .............................................. 39
      3.4.2.2 Required Attachments to the Complaint Proving Ownership .................... 40
    3.4.3 Pleading Requirements As to the Nature of the Collector’s Claim ...................... 40
    3.4.4 Defective Summons and Service ......................................................... 41
    3.4.5 Signature and Verification of the Complaint .............................................. 41
    3.4.6 False or Vague Pleadings ............................................................... 42
  3.5 Problems with Attachments to the Complaint ...................................................... 42
    3.5.1 Required Attachments to the Complaint .................................................. 42
    3.5.2 Is the Attachment Actually Attached? ..................................................... 43
    3.5.3 Sufficiency of an Attached Document ..................................................... 43
    3.5.4 Attachments for Account Stated Claims .................................................... 44
  3.6 Statute of Limitations ......................................................................................... 45
    3.6.1 Raising the Defense ............................................................................. 45
    3.6.2 Federal Statutes of Limitations ............................................................... 45
      3.6.2.1 General ....................................................................................... 45
      3.6.2.2 Two-Year Federal Limitations for Cell Phone and Long Distance Phone Charges 46
        3.6.2.2.1 General .................................................................................. 46
        3.6.2.2.2 Scope of the two-year limitations provision .................................. 46
        3.6.2.2.3 Fifth Circuit denies applicability of the federal limitations period ......... 46
        3.6.2.2.4 Federal limitations period applies to assignees .............................. 47
    3.6.3 Which State’s Statute of Limitations Applies? ............................................. 47
      3.6.3.1 The Forum State or the State Selected in the Credit Agreement? .................. 47
        3.6.3.1.1 General .................................................................................. 47
        3.6.3.1.2 Use of the forum state’s limitations period when it is the shortest ...... 47
        3.6.3.1.3 Use of contractually chosen state when it is the shortest ................. 47
        3.6.3.1.4 States not using the shorter contractually chosen state’s limitations period 49
3.6.3.2 Borrowing Statutes: Using the Shorter Limitations Period of the State Where the Action Arose
3.6.3.2.1 Borrowing statutes described
3.6.3.2.2 Borrowing statutes retain forum states’ shorter limitations periods
3.6.3.2.3 Borrowing statutes limit actions by out-of-state creditors
3.6.3.2.4 Interaction of borrowing statute and law of state chosen in the contract
3.6.3.2.5 When borrowing statute is not applicable

3.6.4 Differing Statutes of Limitation Within a State
3.6.4.1 General
3.6.4.2 State-by-State Listing of Limitations Periods for Breach of Contract
3.6.4.3 UCC Limitations Period for Credit Sales and Leases
3.6.4.4 UCC Limitations Period for Dishonored Checks and Defaulted Promissory Notes

3.6.5 The Statute of Limitations Cannot Be Extended by Contract

3.6.6 Determining Which Statute of Limitations in a State Applies
3.6.6.1 General
3.6.6.2 Application of UCC “Sales” Limitations Period to Credit Sales, Store Credit Cards, and Utilities
3.6.6.3 Applicable Limitations Period for Bank-Issued Credit Cards
3.6.6.3.1 General
3.6.6.3.2 Written contract limitations period inapplicable if claim not for breach of written contract
3.6.6.3.3 Is a written credit card agreement a “contract in writing”?

3.6.7 When Does the Limitations Period Start Running?
3.6.7.1 General
3.6.7.2 Date Triggering Limitations Period for Credit Card Debt
3.6.7.3 Proving the Date of Default

3.6.8 Is the Limitations Period Tolled or Revived?
3.6.8.1 Terminology
3.6.8.2 Tolling the Limitations Period
3.6.8.2.1 Military service
3.6.8.2.2 Bankruptcy
3.6.8.2.3 Time spent out of state
3.6.8.2.4 Out-of-state tolling when non-forum limitations period applies
3.6.8.2.5 Voluntary dismissal of a case does not toll the period

3.6.8.3 Reviving the Limitations Period
3.6.8.3.1 Part payment
3.6.8.3.2 Acknowledgment of the debt

Chapter 4

Proof of the Merits of the Collector’s Claims

4.1 Introduction
4.2 Sufficiency of the Collector’s Evidence
4.2.1 Introduction
4.2.2 Collector’s Request for Admissions
4.2.2.1 General
4.2.2.2 How to Respond to Requests for Admissions

4.2.2.2.1 General ........................................ 68
4.2.2.2.2 Neither admitting nor denying .................. 68
4.2.2.2.3 Objecting to requests for admissions .......... 69
4.2.2.2.4 Denying requests for admissions ............... 69
4.2.2.2.5 Admitting to certain parts of a statement and denying other parts ............................... 70

4.2.2.3 Requesting Relief When Time Period to Respond Has Lapsed ........ 70

4.2.2.4 Limiting the Impact of Facts Deemed Admitted .......... 71

4.2.2.4.1 Introduction .................................. 71
4.2.2.4.2 Admissions conflicting with other admissions or with the collector’s evidence .................. 71
4.2.2.4.3 Narrowly interpret admissions and point out ambiguities ........................................ 71
4.2.2.4.4 Consumer can admit only to the facts, not to legal opinions .................................. 72
4.2.2.4.5 Technical defects with the request for admissions .................................................. 72
4.2.2.4.6 When consumer’s failure to respond properly was a matter of form, not substance .......... 72

4.2.2.5 Suit Against Collector for Abuses Related to Requests for Admissions .......................... 72

4.2.3 Collector’s Use of Affidavits As Evidence .......... 72

4.2.3.1 Introduction ....................................... 72
4.2.3.2 Use of Affidavits at Trial ........................................ 72
4.2.3.3 Based upon the Affiant’s Personal Knowledge ........ 73

4.2.3.3.1 General ........................................ 73
4.2.3.3.2 Robo-signed affidavits .......................... 73
4.2.3.3.3 Attorney affirmations and verified complaints ........................................ 74

4.2.3.4 Conclusory Affidavits; Missing Attachments .......... 74
4.2.3.5 Inconsistent, Sloppy, and False Information ........ 75
4.2.3.6 Notarizations and Signatures ....................... 75
4.2.3.7 Consumer Use of a Counter-Affidavit ............ 75

4.2.4 Proof Using Documents ..................................... 76

4.2.4.1 The Business Records Exception .................... 76

4.2.4.1.1 General ........................................ 76
4.2.4.1.2 Documents generated only for the litigation .... 76
4.2.4.1.3 Documents generated as part of a transfer of accounts ........................................ 77
4.2.4.1.4 Trustworthiness .................................. 77
4.2.4.1.5 No exception for self-generated computer records and operative documents .......... 77

4.2.4.2 Affidavits Must Certify Business Records ............ 77

4.2.4.3 Can a Debt Buyer Authenticate a Creditor’s Business Records? .................................... 79
4.2.4.3.1 The general rule .................................. 79
4.2.4.3.2 The minority rule of incorporation ............... 80
4.2.4.3.3 Minority rule inapplicable to debt buyers who fail to incorporate records .................. 80
4.2.4.3.4 Minority rule inapplicable to records that are not trustworthy .................................. 81
4.2.4.3.5 When affiant is not even an employee of the debt buyer ........................................ 82
4.2.4.3.6 The New Jersey rule ................................ 82
Collection Actions

4.2.4.4 Electronic Records .................................................. 82
4.2.4.5 The Consumer’s Discovery As to the Affiant’s Knowledge .... 83
4.2.4.6 Consumer Authentication of Creditor’s Business Records ...... 83

4.2 Collector As Real Party in Interest or Owner of the Debt .............. 83
4.3.1 Introduction .......................................................... 83
4.3.2 When a Bank or Other Creditor Is the Plaintiff .................. 84
4.3.2.1 General ......................................................... 84
4.3.2.2 Securitization of Credit Card Obligations .................... 85
4.3.3 Collection Agency’s Ability to Bring Action in Own Name on Behalf of Another .............................................. 86
4.3.4 Debt Buyer’s Proof of Ownership of the Debt ...................... 87
4.3.4.1 Ownership Is a Precondition to a Collection Suit ............. 87
4.3.4.2 Adequate Proof of Transfer of Ownership to a Debt Buyer .... 88
4.3.4.2.1 Collector must produce the actual document assigning ownership ........................................... 88
4.3.4.2.2 Assignment document must reference the account at issue ..................................................... 88
4.3.4.2.3 Other defects in the assignment document ................ 90
4.3.4.2.4 Statutory requirements as to the assignment document ...................................................... 91
4.3.4.2.5 Affidavit authenticating document assigning ownership ...................................................... 91
4.3.4.3 Debt Buyer Must Prove a Complete Chain of Ownership ...... 92
4.3.4.3.1 General ......................................................... 92
4.3.4.3.2 Assignor in one link must have exact same name as assignee in prior link ................................. 93
4.3.4.3.3 The assignment dates at each link in the chain must line up ...................................................... 93
4.3.4.3.4 Debt buyers may trip up in showing proper links at beginning of the chain ............................... 93
4.3.4.4 Determining What Rights Have Been Assigned ................. 94
4.3.4.5 Is Notice of Assignment a Precondition to Suing on the Debt? 94

4.4 Collector’s Legal Theory in Its Pleadings Controls the Case .......... 94

4.5 Proof of a Written Contract .............................................. 95
4.5.1 Introduction .......................................................... 95
4.5.2 What State Law Applies? ............................................ 96
4.5.3 Proof of the Contract ................................................ 96
4.5.3.1 Introduction ......................................................... 96
4.5.3.2 Contract’s Unavailability No Excuse for Non-Production .... 96
4.5.3.3 Production of the Contract Applicable to the Particular Consumer ........................................... 97
4.5.3.4 Proving Consumer Assent to the Contract ................. 98
4.5.4 Impact on the Collector’s Cause of Action When a Contract Is Not Proven .............................................. 99

4.6 Seeking the Balance Due on Open-End Accounts ...................... 100
4.6.1 No Matter the Legal Claim, Collector Must Prove a Balance Due 100
4.6.2 Nature of Evidence Required to Show Balance Due ............ 101
4.6.3 Specific Items of Proof to Show the Balance Due ................ 101
4.6.4 Must There Be Proof That a Charge Is Reasonable and Authorized? 102

4.7 On Account, Open Account ............................................. 103
4.7.1 Availability of the Cause of Action ................................ 103
4.7.2 Recovery Under an On Account Theory .......................... 103
4.8 Account Stated. ......................................................... 103
  4.8.1 General .......................................................... 103
  4.8.2 Does State Law Recognize the Account Stated Cause of Action? .... 104
  4.8.3 Requirement of an Underlying Obligation .......................... 105
  4.8.4 Collector Must Introduce into Evidence
        an Adequate Statement of Account .............................. 106
  4.8.5 Has the Account Statement Been Reviewed by the Consumer? ....... 107
  4.8.6 Consumer’s Implied Consent .................................. 108
        4.8.6.1 General .................................................. 108
        4.8.6.2 Consumer’s Inaction and Silence After
               Receiving Regular Monthly Statements .................. 108
        4.8.6.3 Special Considerations for Credit Card Obligations .......... 109
        4.8.6.4 No Implied Consent from Consumer’s Failure
               to Use Federal Dispute Rights ................................ 111
        4.8.6.4.1 General ............................................... 111
        4.8.6.4.2 Incorrect minority view that FCBA
               creates affirmative duty on consumers ..................... 111

4.9 Quantum Meruit or Unjust Enrichment .................................. 112
4.10 Other Causes of Action ............................................. 113

Chapter 5

Defenses and Counterclaims

5.1 About This Chapter .................................................. 115
  5.1.1 What This Chapter Covers ...................................... 115
  5.1.2 Defenses and Counterclaims Analyzed Elsewhere ................... 115
5.2 Disputing the Amount Owed ......................................... 116
  5.2.1 Collector Error in Determining Amount Due ...................... 116
  5.2.2 Misapplication of Payments ..................................... 117
  5.2.3 Sales-Related Claims As Defense to Credit Card Obligation ....... 117
  5.2.4 Servicemembers’ Dispute As to Finance Charges ................. 118
  5.2.5 Debt or Interest Portion of Debt Is Void ....................... 118
  5.2.6 Proving Debt Already Settled ................................... 118
        5.2.6.1 General .................................................. 118
        5.2.6.2 Developing the Consumer’s Evidence .................... 119
        5.2.6.3 IRS Form 1099-C As Evidence of Debt Cancellation ....... 119
        5.2.6.4 Charging Off a Debt Does Not Cancel the Debt .......... 120
  5.2.7 Discharging the Debt by Accord and Satisfaction ................ 120
  5.2.8 Prior Collection Action on the Same Debt ..................... 121
  5.2.9 Debts Discharged in Bankruptcy ................................ 121
5.3 Someone Else Owes the Debt ........................................ 122
  5.3.1 When Collector Mistakenly Identifies the Consumer As the Debtor 122
  5.3.2 Identity Theft and Other Unauthorized Charges ................... 123
        5.3.2.1 General .................................................. 123
        5.3.2.2 Federal Protections Against Unauthorized Use ........... 124
        5.3.2.3 Right to Obtain Information About an
               Account Opened by an Identity Thief ...................... 124
        5.3.2.4 Consumer Actions After Discovering Identity Theft ....... 124
  5.3.3 Liability of Authorized Users .................................. 125
        5.3.3.1 Distinguishing Authorized Users from Joint Account Holders 125
        5.3.3.2 Liability of Authorized User for
               Account Owner’s Obligations ................................ 125
        5.3.3.3 Authorized User’s Liability for Own Charges ............. 126

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
5.3.4 Liability of Spouses ........................................... 127
  5.3.4.1 General ................................................... 127
  5.3.4.2 Community Property States ............................. 127
  5.3.4.3 Necessaries Statutes and Liability for Spouses’ Debts in Non-Community Property States ............................. 127
5.3.5 Liability of Family Members for Decedent’s Debts .................. 128
5.3.6 Should the Creditor’s Protection Product Pay the Balance Due? 128
5.4 Unauthorized Prejudgment Interest .................................. 129
  5.4.1 Contractual Prejudgment Interest Requires Proof of Contract and Interest Rate ........................................... 129
  5.4.2 Creditor’s Actions May Limit Right to Prejudgment Interest ............................. 130
    5.4.2.1 Card Issuers Typically Stop Seeking Prejudgment Interest .................. 130
    5.4.2.2 Evidence Required to Show Card Issuer Opted to Forgo Prejudgment Interest .................. 131
    5.4.2.3 Seeking Statutory Prejudgment Interest When There Is No Right to Contractual Interest ............................. 131
  5.4.3 Is the Amount of Contractual Prejudgment Interest Legal? 132
    5.4.3.1 Originating Creditor’s Interest Charge .................. 132
    5.4.3.2 Can Debt Buyers Bootstrap onto Original Creditor’s Rate Exportation Rights? ................. 132
    5.4.3.3 When Does the Right to Prejudgment Interest Begin to Accrue? .................. 133
5.5 Incapacity and Duress ............................................ 133
  5.5.1 The Consumer’s Incapacity—Minority, Mental Incompetence, or Intoxication ............................. 133
    5.5.1.1 General ................................................... 133
    5.5.1.2 Minority .................................................. 134
    5.5.1.3 Mental Incompetence ................................... 134
    5.5.1.4 Intoxication .............................................. 135
  5.5.2 Duress ..................................................... 135
5.6 No Deficiency When Insufficient Proof of Commercially Reasonable Sale ........................................... 135
5.7 Counterclaims .................................................... 136
  5.7.1 General Tactical Considerations in Raising Counterclaims .................. 136
    5.7.1.1 Permissive vs. Compulsory Counterclaims .................. 136
    5.7.1.2 Impact of Counterclaims on the Collector’s Litigation .................. 136
    5.7.1.3 Counterclaims May Lead to Consumer Attorney Fees .................. 136
    5.7.1.4 Counterclaims May Avoid Statute of Limitations Problems ............................. 137
    5.7.1.5 Counterclaims May Avoid Arbitration Requirements .................. 137
    5.7.1.6 Federal Counterclaims Stay in State Court .................. 137
  5.7.2 Special Tactical Considerations for Litigation Misconduct Counterclaims ............................. 137
    5.7.2.1 Reasons to Bring Litigation Misconduct As a Counterclaim .................. 137
    5.7.2.2 Reasons to Litigate Collection Misconduct in a Subsequent Proceeding .................. 138
  5.7.3 Class Counterclaims .......................................... 139
  5.7.4 Types of Counterclaims ....................................... 140
    5.7.4.1 Counterclaims Related to Litigation Conduct .................. 140
    5.7.4.2 Counterclaims Related to Collection Conduct .................. 141
    5.7.4.3 Counterclaims Against the Originating Creditor .................. 141
    5.7.4.4 Counterclaims Related to the Sales Transaction .................. 142
Part II Special Types of Collections

Chapter 6 Creditors' Recovery of Attorney Fees, Collection Expenses, Postjudgment Interest

6.1 Overview ......................................................... 143
6.2 Is the Creditor Entitled to Recover Attorney Fees? ...................................... 145
   6.2.1 American Rule Denies Fees .................................. 145
   6.2.2 Whether a Contractual Attorney Fee Is Permissible .................. 145
   6.2.3 Is There a Contract with the Consumer? .......................... 148
   6.2.4 Interpreting Contractual Provisions for Collection Attorney Fees ........ 151
      6.2.4.1 Strict Construction of Attorney Fee Clauses .................. 151
      6.2.4.2 Interpreting the Scope of an Attorney Fee Clause .......... 151
      6.2.4.3 Fees for Postjudgment Legal Work .......................... 155
      6.2.4.4 References to "Costs" ........................................ 156
6.3 State Statutes Allowing Recovery of Attorney Fees Regardless of Contract Terms .......... 157
   6.3.1 Construction of State Fee-Shifting Statutes ........................ 157
   6.3.2 Statutes Allowing Fees for Suit on "Account Stated" or Open Account .......... 158
   6.3.3 Statutes Allowing Fees for Suit on a Contract .................. 159
   6.3.4 Other State Fee-Shifting Statutes ................................ 162
6.4 Is the Creditor the Prevailing Party? ................................................. 163
6.5 Determining the Amount of Attorney Fees a Creditor May Recover ................. 167
   6.5.1 Statutory Caps on Fees .......................................... 167
   6.5.2 Requirement That Contractual Fees be Reasonable in Amount .......... 168
   6.5.3 Percentage-Based Fees .......................................... 171
6.6 Collection Agency Fees .................................................. 173
6.7 Postjudgment Interest ....................................................... 175
   6.7.1 Introduction .................................................... 175
   6.7.2 Postjudgment Interest in State Court ................................ 175
      6.7.2.1 State Postjudgment Interest Statutes ....................... 175
      6.7.2.2 The Contract Rate Versus the Legal Rate Under State Postjudgment Interest Statutes ........................................ 175
         6.7.2.2.1 Significance of the contract rate versus the legal rate .... 175
         6.7.2.2.2 Does the state postjudgment interest statute allow the contract rate to be used? ........................ 176
      6.7.2.3 State law limits on contractual postjudgment interest rates .......... 176
      6.7.2.4 Interstate Enforcement of Postjudgment Interest ................ 177
   6.7.3 Postjudgment Interest in Federal Court .................................. 178
   6.7.4 Proof of a Contractual Postjudgment Interest Rate .......................... 179

Chapter 7 Defending Military Personnel in Collection Actions

7.1 Introduction .......................................................... 181
7.2 State SCRA Statutes Summarized ........................................... 182
7.3 History of the Act and Amendments .......................................... 187
7.4 Who Is Protected by the Act? ............................................ 188
7.5 Procedural Protections in Court Proceedings ..................................... 190
   7.5.1 Introduction ........................................................ 190
   7.5.2 Cases in Which Service Was Obtained and the Servicemember, As Defendant, Has Not Made an Appearance .................. 190

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
Chapter 8

Criminal and Civil Collection of Dishonored Checks

8.1 Introduction ................................................................. 207
8.2 Criminal Dishonored Check Laws. ...................................... 208
  8.2.1 Introduction .......................................................... 208
  8.2.2 Defenses Based on Constitutional Rights ......................... 208
  8.2.3 Post-Dated Checks .................................................. 209
  8.2.4 Checks Given for Preexisting Debts ............................... 210
  8.2.5 Absence of Fraud or Intent ....................................... 211
  8.2.6 Other Limitations and Defenses ................................ 212
  8.2.7 Prosecution for Larceny ............................................ 214
  8.2.8 Dishonored Checks and Bankruptcy ............................... 215
  8.2.9 Diversion Programs ............................................... 217
8.3 Civil Collection of Dishonored Checks ............................... 218
  8.3.1 Civil Dishonored Check Statutes ................................ 218
  8.3.2 Other Authority for Imposition of Fees .......................... 222
  8.3.3 Statute of Limitations for Suit on Dishonored Check ........ 222
8.4 Affirmative Remedies for Abuse of Dishonored Check Laws ........ 223

Chapter 9

Medical Debt

9.1 Introduction ................................................................. 227
  9.1.1 The Problem of Medical Debt .................................... 227
  9.1.2 Aggressive Debt Collection ....................................... 227
  9.1.3 Discriminatory or “Chargemaster” Pricing: How the Poor Pay More. 229
  9.1.4 Practical Solutions for Medical Debt ............................. 231
  9.1.5 Determining the Extent of a Consumer’s Medical Debt ........ 232
9.2 FDCPA Claims for Medical Debt Collection Abuses .................. 233
  9.2.1 Applicability of FDCPA to Medical Debt ......................... 233
Collection Actions

9.4.3.6 Illinois .......................................................... 268
9.4.3.7 Kansas ............................................................. 269
9.4.3.8 Louisiana .......................................................... 269
9.4.3.9 Maryland .......................................................... 269
9.4.3.10 Massachusetts ..................................................... 270
9.4.3.11 Minnesota ......................................................... 270
9.4.3.12 Nevada ............................................................. 270
9.4.3.13 New Jersey ....................................................... 271
9.4.3.14 New York .......................................................... 271
9.4.3.15 North Carolina ..................................................... 272
9.4.3.16 North Dakota ....................................................... 272
9.4.3.17 Ohio ................................................................. 272
9.4.3.18 Oklahoma .......................................................... 272
9.4.3.19 Rhode Island ....................................................... 273
9.4.3.20 Tennessee .......................................................... 273
9.4.3.21 Utah ................................................................. 273
9.4.3.22 Virginia ............................................................ 273
9.4.3.23 Washington State ................................................ 273
9.4.3.24 West Virginia ...................................................... 273
9.4.4 Health Care Providers As Brokers ................................... 274
  9.4.4.1 Pitfalls of Medical Debt Converted to Credit Card or Other Debt .......................................................... 274
  9.4.4.2 Legal Challenges Under State Loan Broker and Other Laws ......................................................... 275
9.4.5 Claims Based on Hospital's Charitable Status ................. 276
  9.4.5.1 General ........................................................... 276
  9.4.5.2 Nonprofit Hospital Litigation Cases .......................... 277
9.4.6 Other State Common Law Claims ................................ 278
9.5 Defenses to a Medical Debt Collection Action ................... 280
  9.5.1 General ............................................................ 280
  9.5.2 Account Stated Actions ........................................... 281
  9.5.3 Open Account or On Account Actions .......................... 282
9.5.4 Defenses to Contract Claims ....................................... 283
  9.5.4.1 General ........................................................... 283
  9.5.4.2 Duress As a Defense ............................................ 284
9.5.5 Quantum Meruit ..................................................... 286
9.5.6 Reasonable Value ................................................... 288
  9.5.6.1 Proof of Reasonable Value ................................... 288
    9.5.6.1.1 General ...................................................... 288
    9.5.6.1.2 Factors determining reasonable value .................. 290
    9.5.6.1.3 Testimony and other evidence as to reasonable value ......................................................... 290
  9.5.6.2 Reasonable Value and Discriminatory Pricing ........... 292
  9.5.6.3 Overbilling, Error, and Hospital Negligence .............. 294
9.5.7 Other Defenses or Counterclaims in Medical Debt Collection Suits ......................................................... 294
  9.5.7.1 Using Affirmative Claims Defensively ...................... 294
  9.5.7.2 Other Defenses .................................................. 295
9.6 Liability for Familial Medical Care Under Necessaries Statutes ......................................................... 295
  9.6.1 Extent of Liability ................................................ 295
  9.6.2 Limits on Spousal Liability ..................................... 296
  9.6.3 Impact of Divorce or Separation ................................ 298
  9.6.4 Liability of Parents and Children .............................. 299
Chapter 10  Federal Administrative Agency Collections

10.1  Debt Collection Powers of the Federal Government ........................................ 305
    10.1.1  The Federal Government’s Administrative and Judicial Debt Collection Powers 305
    10.1.2  The Federal Government’s Collection of State Debts ................................ 305

10.2  Federal Agencies’ Non-Litigation Collection Methods ...................................... 305
    10.2.1  Overview of Federal Collection Laws and Regulations .............................. 305
            10.2.1.1  Federal Collection Statutes ......................................................... 305
            10.2.1.2  Regulations Under the Claims Collection Act ................................. 306
            10.2.1.3  What Debts the Claims Collection Act Governs ............................... 306
    10.2.2  The Federal Agency Must Make Proper Written Demand for Payment ............. 307
    10.2.3  Release of Information to Credit Reporting Agencies and Others ................. 307
    10.2.4  Contracts with Private Debt Collection Agencies and Collection Lawyers .......... 308
    10.2.5  Interest, Administrative Charges, and Penalties ................................... 309
    10.2.6  Administrative Wage Garnishment ....................................................... 309
    10.2.7  Offset Against Federal Employee’s Salary ........................................... 310
    10.2.8  Tax Refund Interception ...................................................................... 311
    10.2.9  Administrative Offset Against Federal Benefits and Other Payments ............ 313
            10.2.9.1  General ................................................................................. 313
            10.2.9.2  Benefits and Other Federal Payments Against Which Debts Can Be Offset 314
            10.2.9.3  Offset Calculations for Social Security, Black Lung Act, and Railroad   315
                        Retirement Benefits ................................................................. 315
            10.2.9.4  Offset Procedures .................................................................. 315
            10.2.9.5  Defenses to Offsets ............................................................... 317
    10.2.10  Denial of Federal Loans, Loan Insurance, and Guarantees ............................ 317
    10.2.11  Installment Plans and Other Compromises .............................................. 318
    10.2.12  Suspension, Termination, and Discharge of Claims .................................. 318
    10.2.13  Federal Agencies’ Implementation of Collection Requirements .................. 319
            10.2.13.1  Survey of Selected Agencies ...................................................... 319
            10.2.13.2  Department of Education: Student Loans ...................................... 319
            10.2.13.3  Department of Health and Human Services .................................. 320
            10.2.13.4  Department of Housing and Urban Development ............................ 320
            10.2.13.5  Department of Veterans Affairs .............................................. 320
            10.2.13.6  Department of Agriculture ....................................................... 321
    10.2.14  Debtor Remedies for Illegal Agency Collection Practices .......................... 321
            10.2.14.1  Introduction ......................................................................... 321
            10.2.14.2  Bivens Suit .......................................................................... 322
            10.2.14.3  Suit Under Privacy Act ............................................................ 323
            10.2.14.4  Administrative Procedures Act .................................................. 324
            10.2.14.5  Federal Tort Claims Act ........................................................... 326
            10.2.14.6  Tucker Acts .......................................................................... 329
            10.2.14.7  Seeking Relief in the Court That Determined the Debt ..................... 331
            10.2.14.8  Violation of Bankruptcy Stay ..................................................... 331
Collection Actions

10.2.14.9 Fair Debt Collection Practices Act and Fair Credit Reporting Act .................................................. 331
10.2.14.10 State Agencies ........................................................................................................................................ 332
10.2.14.11 Remedies for Abuses by IRS ............................................................................................................. 332
10.2.14.12 Government Counterclaim for the Debt ............................................................................................. 335

10.3 Federal Debt Collection Procedures Act ....................................................................................................... 335
10.3.1 Civil Procedure and Exemptions for Collection of Federal Government’s Claims ........................................ 335
10.3.2 Six-Year Statute of Limitations; Time Period for Enforcement of Judgment .............................................. 337
10.3.3 Prejudgment Remedies ............................................................................................................................ 337
10.3.4 Postjudgment Remedies ........................................................................................................................... 337
10.3.4.1 Overview ............................................................................................................................................ 337
10.3.4.2 Judgment Liens ..................................................................................................................................... 337
10.3.4.3 Garnishment and Installment Payments .............................................................................................. 337
10.3.4.4 Debtor’s Ability to Challenge Postjudgment Remedy ......................................................................... 338
10.3.5 Seizure of Property; Exemptions .................................................................................................................. 338
10.3.6 Government’s Right to Impose a Surcharge ............................................................................................. 340
10.3.7 Distant Filing of Collection Suits Possible ................................................................................................ 340

Chapter 11 Criminal Justice Debt

11.1 First Considerations ........................................................................................................................................... 343
11.1.1 Need for Criminal Justice Debt Representation ......................................................................................... 343
11.1.2 Topics Covered in This Chapter .................................................................................................................. 343
11.1.3 Types of Criminal Justice Debt ................................................................................................................ 344
11.1.4 Joining the Court Debt Listserv ............................................................................................................... 344
11.2 Constitutional Protections ................................................................................................................................ 344
11.2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 344
11.2.2 Debtors’ Prisons ......................................................................................................................................... 344
11.2.3 Unduly Harsh or Discriminatory Collection of Government Debt ................................................................ 345
11.2.4 Constitutionally Required Procedural Safeguards ....................................................................................... 346
11.3 Minimizing Imposition of Criminal Justice Debt ............................................................................................ 347
11.3.1 Importance of Focusing on Criminal Justice Debt at Imposition ............................................................. 347
11.3.2 Checklist Concerning Imposition of Criminal Justice Debts .................................................................... 348
11.3.3 Mandatory Versus Non-Mandatory Debts ................................................................................................. 348
11.3.4 Ability-to-Pay Determinations at Imposition ............................................................................................ 349
11.3.4.1 Requirements Prior to Determination of Costs ....................................................................................... 349
11.3.4.2 Requirements Prior to Imposition of Fines .............................................................................................. 350
11.3.4.3 Remission Is an Inadequate Substitute for a Pre-Imposition Ability-to-Pay Inquiry ............................... 351
11.3.5 Representing Clients in Ability-to-Pay Hearings ......................................................................................... 352
11.3.5.1 Adequacy of Ability-to-Pay Hearing ......................................................................................................... 352
11.3.5.2 Ability-to-Pay Standards ......................................................................................................................... 353
11.3.5.3 Future Ability to Repay ................................................................................................................................ 353
11.3.5.4 Tension Between Describing Defendant As a Productive Member of Society and Unable to Pay .......... 354
11.3.6 Plea Bargaining and Criminal Justice Debt .................................................................................................. 354
11.3.7 Community Service As an Alternative to Criminal Justice Debt ............................................................ 355
11.3.8 Communicating with the Client ................................................................................................................... 355
11.3.8.1 General .................................................................................................................................................. 355
11.3.8.2 Discuss Criminal Justice Debt at Each Stage of Representation ............................................................ 356
11.4 Collection of Criminal Justice Debt ........................................... 357
  11.4.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 357
  11.4.2 The Advocacy Gap ................................................................. 357
      11.4.2.1 General ........................................................................... 357
      11.4.2.2 Representation by LSC-Funded Offices ......................... 358
  11.4.3 Checklist Concerning Collection of Criminal Justice Debt ........................................................................... 358
    11.4.3.1 Representation of Client.................................................. 358
    11.4.3.2 Read Record to Client ...................................................... 358
    11.4.3.3 Review Criminal Justice Debt Sentence with the Client . 359
    11.4.3.4 Prepare the Client for Criminal Justice Debt Hearings ... 359
    11.4.3.5 Appearance of Counsel at Hearing ................................. 359
    11.4.3.6 Request Time to Review Government Papers ............... 359
    11.4.3.7 Request Time to Prepare for Hearing ............................. 359
    11.4.3.8 Review Hearings ............................................................. 359
    11.4.3.9 Request Consideration of Writ of Habeas Corpus ......... 360
    11.4.3.10 Appeal of Criminal Justice Debt Conviction .............. 360
  11.4.4 Defending Against Incarceration Based on Inability to Pay ................................................................. 359
  11.4.5 Defending Against Activation of a Suspended Sentence ........................................................................... 359
    11.4.5.1 Review of Sentence ......................................................... 359
    11.4.5.2 Insure Against Incarceration ................................. 359
    11.4.5.3 Appeal of Sentence ......................................................... 360
  11.4.6 Remission or Modification of Criminal Justice Debts ....... 360
  11.4.7 Statute of Limitations .............................................................. 360
  11.4.8 State Constitutional Limits on Criminal Justice Debt Enforcement ......................................................... 360
    11.4.8.1 Statute of Limitations ...................................................... 360
    11.4.8.2 Effect of Limitations Period on State Collection Remedies 361
    11.4.8.3 Laches ............................................................................. 361
  11.5 Exemption Law and Criminal Justice Debt ................................................................. 361
    11.5.1 General ................................................................................. 362
    11.5.2 Exemptions at the Imposition Stage .................................... 362
    11.5.3 State Exemptions Applicable to State and Municipal Criminal Justice Debt ......................................................... 362
      11.5.3.1 Introduction .................................................................. 363
      11.5.3.2 Garnishment of Earnings .............................................. 363
      11.5.3.3 Federal and State Public Benefits and Tax Refunds ....... 364
      11.5.3.4 Retirement Benefits ...................................................... 364
      11.5.3.5 Bank Accounts ............................................................. 364
    11.5.4 Federal Exemptions Applicable to State and Municipal Criminal Justice Debt ......................................................... 364
      11.5.4.1 States Cannot Limit Federal Exemptions ....................... 365
      11.5.4.2 Earnings ....................................................................... 365
      11.5.4.3 Benefits and Retirement Benefits ............................... 366
      11.5.4.4 Student Loan Disbursements ....................................... 366
    11.5.5 State Exemptions Applicable to State and Municipal Criminal Justice Debt ......................................................... 366
      11.5.5.1 State Exemptions Overview .......................................... 367
      11.5.5.2 Homestead ................................................................. 367
      11.5.5.3 Public Benefits, Tax Refunds, and Retirement Benefits .... 367
    11.5.6 Due Process, Equal Protections, and Exemptions ................................................................. 368
  11.6 Criminal Justice Debt and Bankruptcy ........................................ 368
    11.6.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 368
    11.6.2 The Automatic Stay .............................................................. 368
    11.6.3 Dischargeability of Criminal Justice Debts Under Chapter 7 369
      11.6.3.1 General ........................................................................... 369
      11.6.3.2 Criminal Fines ............................................................... 369
      11.6.3.3 Civil Penalties ............................................................... 369
      11.6.3.4 Victim Restitution ......................................................... 370
      11.6.3.5 Juvenile Restitution Owed by Parents ......................... 370
      11.6.3.6 Differentiating Between Various Types of Costs ........... 370
      11.6.3.7 Costs of Prosecution and Indigent Defense Fees .......... 371
      11.6.3.8 Costs of Incarceration ................................................... 371
      11.6.3.9 Costs Related to Deferred Judgment .......................... 372
      11.6.3.10 Surcharges ................................................................. 372
Collection Actions

11.7.4.1 Application of FDCPA Substantive
11.7.3.2 Proof of an ECOA Disparate Impact Claim
11.7.3.3 Examples of ECOA Criminal Justice Debt Claims
11.7.6.1 Sovereign and Qualified Immunity
11.7.6.2 Absolute Judicial Immunity
11.7.6.3 Abstention
11.7.6.4 Chapter 13 Bankruptcy
11.7.1.1 Due Process and Right to Counsel
11.7.1.2 Equal Protection
11.7.1.3 Bias Based Upon Financial Interests
11.7.1.4 Excessive fines
11.7.1.5 Examples of Affirmative Constitutional Claims
11.7.2 Title VI of the Civil Rights Act
11.7.3 Equal Credit Opportunity Act
11.7.4 The Fair Debt Collection Practices Act
11.7.4.1 Application of FDCPA Substantive Requirements to Criminal Justice Debt
11.7.4.2 Actors Covered by the FDCPA
11.7.4.3 Debts Covered by the FDCPA
11.7.5 Fair Credit Reporting Act
11.7.6 Bars to Affirmative Litigation
11.7.6.1 Sovereign and Qualified Immunity
11.7.6.2 Absolute Judicial Immunity
11.7.6.3 Abstention
11.7.6.4 Plan Confirmation
11.7.3.2.2 Identifying a defendant, policy, and causation
11.7.3.2.1 General
11.7.3.2.3 Shifting the burden
11.7.3.1 Application of the ECOA to Court Debt
11.7.3.2 Proof of an ECOA Disparate Impact Claim
11.7.1.4 Excessive fines
11.7.2 Title VI of the Civil Rights Act
11.7.3 Equal Credit Opportunity Act
11.7.4 The Fair Debt Collection Practices Act
11.7.4.1 Application of FDCPA Substantive Requirements to Criminal Justice Debt
11.7.4.2 Actors Covered by the FDCPA
11.7.4.3 Debts Covered by the FDCPA
11.7.5 Fair Credit Reporting Act
11.7.6 Bars to Affirmative Litigation
11.7.6.1 Sovereign and Qualified Immunity
11.7.6.2 Absolute Judicial Immunity
11.7.6.3 Abstention
11.7.6.4 Plan Confirmation
11.6.4.2 Criminal Justice Debt Subject to Discharge Under Chapter 13
11.6.4.3 Debts Covered by the FDCPA
11.6.6.1 Bail Bonds
11.6.6.2 Absolute Judicial Immunity
11.6.6.3 Abstention
11.6.6.4 Plan Confirmation
11.6.6.5 Notice to the Prevailing Party
11.6.6.6 Other Remedies

Part III

Chapter 12

Challenging a Collection Judgment

12.1 Introduction
12.2 Servicemembers’ Federal Right to Vacate Default Judgment
12.3 Setting Aside a Default, Stipulated, or Litigated Judgment
12.3.1 Collectors Do Not Always Contest Motion to Set Aside a Judgment
12.3.2 The Law Favors Setting Aside a Default Judgment
12.3.3 Stipulated Judgments
12.3.4 General State Standards for Setting Aside a Judgment
12.3.4.1 State Standards Based upon the Federal Rules
12.3.4.2 State Standards Not Following the Federal Rules
12.3.5 Timing Considerations
12.3.6 Meritorious Defense
12.3.7 Prejudice to the Prevailing Party

374
378
380
382
384
386
388
390
392
### Contents

12.3.8 Mistake, Inadvertence, Surprise, or Excusable Neglect .......................... 392
12.3.9 Newly Discovered Evidence ................................................................. 393
12.3.10 Fraud, Misrepresentation, or Misconduct by an Opposing Party .............. 393
   12.3.10.1 General .................................................................................. 393
   12.3.10.2 Fraud on the Consumer ......................................................... 393
   12.3.10.3 A Special Case: Mailing Stipulations with the Complaint ............. 394
   12.3.10.4 Fraud on the Court ................................................................. 394
12.3.11 The Judgment Is Void ......................................................................... 394
   12.3.11.1 Improper Service of the Complaint or Notice of the Default Hearing... 394
      12.3.11.1.1 General ........................................................................ 394
      12.3.11.1.2 Sewer service ................................................................ 395
      12.3.11.1.3 Mail service to the wrong address ................................... 396
      12.3.11.1.4 Improper notice of the default hearing ......................... 397
   12.3.11.2 Other Jurisdictional Challenges ............................................... 398
      12.3.11.2.1 General ........................................................................ 398
      12.3.11.2.2 Court does not have authority to issue the award ............. 398
      12.3.11.2.3 When there is insufficient evidence that plaintiff owns the debt... 398
      12.3.11.2.4 When unlicensed plaintiff cannot use the state’s courts ........ 399
12.3.12 “Any Other Reason That Justifies Relief” ............................................. 399
12.3.13 Noncompliance with State Preconditions to Obtain Default Judgments ...... 400
12.3.14 Mass Vacatur .................................................................................. 401

### Chapter 13

**Enforcement of Judgments: General Principles, Constitutional Issues**

13.1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 405
13.2 Constitutionality and Validity of Exemption Laws ................................... 406
   13.2.1 Statutory Amendments That Increase Exemptions
      Do Not Unconstitutionally Impair Contracts ........................................ 406
   13.2.2 Due Process and the Taking of Property ....................................... 407
   13.2.3 Equal Protection ......................................................................... 408
   13.2.4 Validity of Bifurcated Exemption Schemes .................................... 409
   13.2.5 Validity Under State Constitutions .............................................. 409
13.3 Interpretation and Operation of Exemption Laws ..................................... 410
   13.3.1 Exemption Laws Must Be Liberally Construed in Favor of the Debtor ... 410
   13.3.2 Exempt Property Purchased with Non-Exempt Funds or Proceeds of Wrongdoing ................................................................. 413
   13.3.3 Proceeds of Exempt Property ..................................................... 417
   13.3.4 Procedure for Claiming Exemptions .......................................... 421
   13.3.5 Marshalling of Assets .................................................................. 422
   13.3.6 Wildcard Exemptions ................................................................. 422
   13.3.7 Stacking of Exemptions ............................................................... 424
   13.3.8 Interstate Enforcement of Judgments ............................................ 426
      13.3.8.1 General ........................................................................... 426
      13.3.8.2 Use of One State’s Courts to Enforce Another State’s Judgment ... 427

Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library

xxv
Collection Actions

13.3.8.3 Bank Accounts ........................................... 428
13.3.8.4 Wages .................................................... 430
13.3.8.5 Application of the FDCPA’s Venue Abuse Prohibition ...... 432
13.3.9 Waiver of Exemptions .................................... 432
13.3.9.1 General .................................................. 432
13.3.9.2 FTC Prohibition of Waiver of Exemptions ................. 434
13.4 Special Exemption Schemes for Particular Types of Debt ....... 434
13.4.1 Health Care Debts ....................................... 434
13.4.2 IRS Debts, Federal Restitution Orders, and Other Federal Debts .... 434
13.4.2.1 IRS Debts .............................................. 434
13.4.2.2 Fines and Restitution .................................. 435
13.4.2.3 Other Federal Debts .................................... 436
13.4.2.4 Alimony, Child Support, and Similar Claims ............... 436
13.5 Due Process Protections from Garnishment or Execution on Exempt Property ........................................ 438
13.5.1 Introduction ............................................... 438
13.5.2 The Constitutional Balancing of Interests ...................... 439
13.5.3 Prompt Post-Garnishment Notice Is Required .................. 441
13.5.4 Notice Must Inform Debtor of Exemptions .................... 443
13.5.5 Notice Must Inform Debtor of Procedures to Contest Garnishment .... 444
13.5.6 Debtor Has a Right to a Prompt Hearing ....................... 444
13.5.7 Due Process Issues When Account Is Frozen upon Bank’s Receipt of Garnishment Notice ......................... 445
13.6 Other Limits on Enforceability of Judgments .................... 446
13.6.1 Assignment of Judgments .................................. 446
13.6.2 Statutes of Limitations for Enforcement of Judgments ......... 447

Chapter 14 Protecting Debtors’ Wages, Benefits, Other Income, and Bank Accounts
14.1 Introduction .................................................. 451
14.2 Protection of Debtors’ Wages ................................ 451
14.2.1 Federal Wage Garnishment Protections ....................... 451
14.2.1.1 Purposes of Consumer Credit Protection Act Wage Garnishment Restrictions .......................... 451
14.2.1.2 The Meaning of “Subject to Garnishment” ............... 451
14.2.1.3 Types of Debts to Which the Protections Apply ............ 453
14.2.1.4 Earnings Subject to CCPA Garnishment Protections ....... 453
14.2.1.4.1 Wages, vacation pay, sick pay ........................ 453
14.2.1.4.2 Periodic pension plan payments ......................... 455
14.2.1.4.3 Tips .................................................. 455
14.2.1.4.4 Payments to independent contractors .................. 456
14.2.1.4.5 Non-periodic payments ................................ 457
14.2.1.5 Calculating the Amount of Wages Protected ............... 459
14.2.1.5.1 Calculation rules ..................................... 459
14.2.1.5.2 Wage garnishment calculations ......................... 460
14.2.1.5.3 Calculations when worker is not paid weekly .......... 460
14.2.1.5.4 Child support and alimony ............................ 460
14.2.1.5.5 Multiple garnishments; multiple jobs ................... 461
14.2.1.6 Federal Protections Against Employee Discharge for Wage Garnishment .......................... 462
14.2.1.6.1 CCPA discharge prohibition .......................... 462
14.2.1.6.2 Criminal and administrative enforcement .............. 462
14.2.1.6.3 Is there a federal private cause of action? ............... 462
14.5.4 Treasury Rule Protects Electronically Deposited Exempt Federal Benefits from Garnishment .............................. 502
14.5.4.1 Introduction .............................................. 502
14.5.4.2 How the Rule Operates ..................................... 503
14.5.4.3 Exceptions for Debts Owed to the Federal Government or a State Child Support Agency .............................. 503
14.5.4.4 A Self-Executing Protection; Debtor No Longer Has Burden of Asserting Exemption at Any Stage .................... 504
14.5.4.5 Commingled Funds, Co-Owners, Lump-Sum Payments ................................. 504
14.5.4.6 Continuing Garnishments and Repeat Garnishments ...................................... 504
14.5.4.7 What If the Debtor Wants to Pay the Debt? ................................................ 505
14.5.4.8 Advising Clients: How to Make the Most of the Treasury Rule’s Protections .............................................. 505
14.5.4.9 The Role of State Protections; Preemption and the Safe Harbor ...................... 505
14.5.4.10 Bank Setoff and Bank Fees ........................................ 506
14.5.5 Practical Ways of Protecting Exempt Funds After Payment ................................... 507
14.5.5.1 Separate Accounts or Special-Purpose Accounts .................................... 507
14.5.5.2 Direct Express Card ........................................... 507
14.5.5.3 Electronic Transfer Accounts (ETAs) .............................................. 507
14.5.6 Judgment Creditor’s Right to Garnish Funds in a Joint Bank Account May Be Limited to Debtor’s Contribution .......... 508
14.5.6.1 Introduction ................................................... 508
14.5.6.2 The Contract Approach ........................................ 509
14.5.6.3 The Net Contribution Approach .................................. 510
14.5.7 Liability for Wrongful Seizure of Bank Account Funds .................................. 512

Chapter 15 Protecting the Debtor’s Home, Tangible Personal Property, and Other Assets
15.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 517
15.2 Homestead Exemptions ............................................................. 517
15.2.1 Introduction ................................................................. 517
15.2.2 What Homesteads Are Protected? ........................................ 517
15.2.2.1 Dollar Amounts or Acreage Protected .......................... 517
15.2.2.2 Distinctions Between Rural and Urban Homesteads ............. 518
15.2.2.3 Multiple Parcels; Subsidiary Structures and Building Materials .......................... 519
15.2.2.4 Non-Traditional Homesteads, Cooperatives, and Manufactured Homes .......... 520
15.2.3 Who May Claim Homestead Exemption .................................. 522
15.2.3.1 Head-of-Household Requirements; Surviving Family Members .......................... 522
15.2.3.2 Effect of Divorce, Joint Tenancy, Co-Ownership by Spouses .............. 523
15.2.3.3 Holders of Remainder Interests and Other Interests Less Than Fee Simple .... 526
15.2.4 Occupancy Requirements and Abandonment ................................ 529
15.2.4.1 Occupancy ......................................................... 529
15.2.4.2 Abandonment ....................................................... 534
15.2.5 Homestead Exemption Limits in Bankruptcy .............................. 538
15.2.5.1 Overview ............................................................. 538
15.2.5.2 Conversion of Non-Exempt Property into Homestead Property; $125,000 Cap .............................................. 539
15.2.5.3 Extraterritoriality ................................................... 539
## Chapter 16  
Debtor’s Examinations and Imprisonment for Debt

16.1 Introduction ................................................. 567  
16.2 Debtor’s Examinations .................................. 567  
16.2.1 Nature of Debtor’s Examinations ................. 567  
16.2.2 Limits on Debtor’s Examinations ................. 567  
16.2.3 Imprisonment and Other Sanctions for  
Failure to Appear At a Debtor’s Examination ......... 567  
16.2.4 Affirmative Claims for Abusive Use of Debtor’s Examinations ... 568  
16.3 Imprisonment for Debt ................................... 569  
16.3.1 State Constitutional and Statutory Provisions .... 569  
16.3.2 Exceptions to the Prohibition .................... 569  
16.3.3 Can a Court Order a Judgment Debtor to Make  
Payments and Enforce the Order by Contempt? ....... 571  
16.3.4 Constitutional Limits on Punishment for Contempt .... 572

## Chapter 17  
Prevailing Consumers’ Postjudgment Actions

17.1 Attorney Fees for the Prevailing Consumer .............. 575  
17.1.1 Introduction ............................................. 575  
17.1.2 Right to Fees Based upon the Contract .............. 575  
17.1.3 Consumer’s Statutory Right to Fees When Collector Has a Contractual Right to Fees .... 575  
17.1.4 State Statutes Provide Fees for the Prevailing  
Party Under Certain Causes of Action ................. 576  
17.1.5 Fee Awards Pursuant to Consumer Counterclaims ...... 577  
17.1.6 A Second Lawsuit to Recover the  
Consumer’s Fees Incurred in the First Action .......... 578  
17.1.7 Fees When Collector Denies the Consumer’s Request for Admissions .... 578  
17.1.8 Attorney Fees for Groundless Litigation .......... 578  
17.1.8.1 Introduction ......................................... 578  
17.1.8.2 Standards for Rule 11 Sanctions .................. 578
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17.1.8.3</td>
<td>State Statutory Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.1.8.4</td>
<td>State-by-State Listing of Standards for Groundless Litigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>Cleaning Up the Consumer’s Credit Record</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.1</td>
<td>The Consumer’s Credit Record</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.1.1</td>
<td>Background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.1.2</td>
<td>Reports Sometimes Fail to Include Court Outcomes Favorable to Consumers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.2</td>
<td>Correcting Inaccurate Information After Prevailing in Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.2.1</td>
<td>The Dispute Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.2.2</td>
<td>Manner of Case’s Resolution Determines Whether Report’s Historical Data Will Be Corrected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3</td>
<td>How to Dispute Information in the Consumer’s File</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3.1</td>
<td>Obtain a Consumer Report on the Consumer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3.2</td>
<td>Send a Dispute at Least to All Three Major Nationwide Consumer Reporting Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3.3</td>
<td>Also Notify the Collector and Original Creditor of the Dispute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3.4</td>
<td>Form of the Request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.3.5</td>
<td>Content of the Dispute Letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.4</td>
<td>When Dispute Fails to Correct the Credit Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.5</td>
<td>Important Steps to Take After Cleaning Up a Credit Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>Responding to Renewed Collection on the Same Debt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>Consumer’s Follow-Up Lawsuit Relating to Collector’s Litigation Misconduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.1</td>
<td>Scope of This Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2</td>
<td>Factors to Consider When Initiating Follow-Up Litigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2.1</td>
<td>Relief Sought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2.2</td>
<td>Must the Consumer’s Claim Have Been Brought As a Compulsory Counterclaim in the Collection Action?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2.3</td>
<td>Choice of Federal or State Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2.4</td>
<td>Timing Considerations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2.5</td>
<td>Arbitration Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3</td>
<td>FDCPA’s Applicability to Litigation Misconduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3.1</td>
<td>FDCPA’s Coverage of Litigation Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3.2</td>
<td>General Standards As to Actionable Litigation Misconduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3.3</td>
<td>The Bona Fide Error Defense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3.4</td>
<td>Examples of Litigation Conduct As FDCPA Violations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.4</td>
<td>UDAP Claims for Litigation Misconduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.5</td>
<td>Malicious Prosecution and Abuse of Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.5.2</td>
<td>Malicious Prosecution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.5.3</td>
<td>Abuse of Process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part IV Appendixes**

Appendix A Selected Provisions of the Servicemembers Civil Relief Act

Appendix B Selected Provisions Governing Collection of Debts Owed to Federal Government

B.1 Debt Collection Improvement Act


B.3 Selected Provisions of Federal Debt Collection Procedures Act

xxx Online with updates at www.nclc.org/library
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Federal Wage Garnishment Statute and Regulations</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.1</td>
<td>Federal Statutory Restrictions on Garnishment</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.2</td>
<td>Department of Labor Wage Garnishment Regulations</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Treasury Rule Protecting Electronically Deposited Exempt Federal Benefits</td>
<td>635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Selected Federal Exemption Provisions</td>
<td>641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.1</td>
<td>Social Security and SSI Benefits</td>
<td>641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.2</td>
<td>Veterans’ Benefits</td>
<td>641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.3</td>
<td>Exception Allowing Enforcement of Child Support Claims Against Social Security and Veterans’ Benefits</td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.4</td>
<td>Civil Service and Federal Retirement and Disability Benefits</td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.5</td>
<td>Servicemembers’ Pay</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.6</td>
<td>Military Annuities and Survivors’ Benefits</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.7</td>
<td>Student Assistance</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.8</td>
<td>Railroad Retirement Benefits</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.9</td>
<td>Merchant Seamen Wages</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.10</td>
<td>Longshoremen’s and Harbor Workers’ Death and Disability Benefits</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.11</td>
<td>Foreign Service Retirement and Disability Benefits</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.12</td>
<td>Compensation for Injury, Death, or Detention of Employees of U.S. Contractors Outside the U.S.</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.13</td>
<td>Federal Emergency Management Agency Federal Disaster Assistance</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Federal Trade Commission Credit Practices Rule</td>
<td>647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Summaries of State Exemption Laws</td>
<td>649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td>693</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>